Exhibit A

Performance Audit of Disaster Management (May 2016)

Action Plan, Timeline and Responsible Agencies

1. Enforcement of provisions of DM Act 2013 should be ensured

The Department of Disaster Management (DDM), Ministry of Home and Cultural Affairs (MoHCA) conducted sensitization on the Disaster Management Act of Bhutan 2013 and DM Rules and Regulation 2014 to all 20 Dzongkhags and four Thromdes in 2014. Moreover, when DDM carries out workshops or trainings for sectors and Dzongkhags, the Department also provides awareness on the enforcement of DM Act and DM Rules & Regulation on a regular basis. In terms of the enforcement of the specific provisions of the Act, we have already formed the National Disaster Management Authority, the Dzongkhag Disaster Management Committees (through Executive Order no.C-2/385 dated 15th May 2014), and technical working groups for Flood and Landslides have also been formed. In addition, Search and Rescue (SAR) teams have been formed in all 20 dzongkhags and 4 thromdes, basic SAR equipment have been procured and distributed and more recently the construction of the National Emergency Operation Centre has been initiated. We have also conducted community based disaster risk management training in all 20 dzongkhags to build capacities of the dzongkhags in preparing their own DM plans. The Dzongkhag DT officers have been appointed to multi task as the DDMOs vide RCSC order no. RCSC/PPD-40/2015/1761 dated 23rd December 2015.

Specifically the RAA findings point to the following:

1.1 Inadequate functioning of the NDMA

The NDMA was constituted on 26 February 2014 and the first NDMA Meeting was convened on 19 March 2014 followed by the second NDMA Meeting on 30 October 2014. In 2015, due to the special order from the Hon'ble Prime Minister, the ***Special Committee for Disaster Preparedness and Response*** was formed to oversee disaster management and also to prepare National Earthquake Contingency Plan. The Special Committee meetings were convened three times *(13 May 2015, 20 May 2015 and 1 June 2015)* and followed by several bilateral meetings with sectors. Since majority of the members of the Special Committee were from the NDMA members, separate NDMA meeting was not convened in 2015. The third NDMA Meeting was convened on 22 April 2016. We would also like to point out that it is difficult to hold regular meetings due to the high level membership.

Action plan: The DDM proposes to enforce the regular meeting as mandated in the DM Act.

Timeline: July 2016- June 2017
Responsible Official: Director/DG, DDM (Member secretary to NDMA)

Exhibit A

Performance Audit of Disaster Management (May 2016)

Action Plan, Timeline and Responsible Agencies

1.2 Non-functioning of DDMCs

The DDMCs have been formed in mid 2014 and DDMOs appointed only on 23rd December 2015. In the absence of fulltime DDMOs till recently and lack of clear direction from the DDMCs to the focal persons, DDMC meetings could not be conducted as per the DM Act. The focal persons had their own sectoral responsibilities and disaster management activities were an additional responsibility for them which received less priority. Further, provisional fund from the annual budget was not kept for the conduct of DDMC and other DM related activities. However, with the start of the new financial year, the DDMOs had been instructed to keep budget provisions for DM related activities.

Action Plan: DM will issue notification to all Dzongkhags for the conduct of DDMC meetings and to carry out their roles and responsibilities as per the DM Act 2013. DDMOs will ensure that DDMC are convened as per the notification and activities carried out as per the provisions of the DM Act 2013.

Timeline: July 2016- June 2017
Responsible Official: DDMOs

1.3 Non-constitution of the IMTF

The DDM proposed formation of IMTF in the first NDMA meeting. However, the NDMA instructed DDM to form hazard based task force group since it was felt that having one task force to provide technical advice and inputs for all hazards may not be practical. Accordingly DDM formed the Landslide and Flood Technical Working Groups.

Action Plan: the DDM proposes to form technical working groups for Earthquakes, Forest fires and fires, and windstorm.

Timeline: July 2016- June 2017
Responsible Officials: Chief, Preparedness and Response Division (PRD)

1.4 Non-recruitment of DDMO

The DDM had proposed to RCSC for recruitment of DDMOs at the dzongkhags, however, given the government's policy of a small and compact civil service and zero growth, the RCSC instructed the existing DT officers to function as the DDMOs at the dzongkhags vide RCSC order no. RCSC/PPD-40/2015/1761 dated 23rd December 2015. To build the capacities of the DDMOs in disaster management, DDM has been conducting various workshops and training programs. Therefore, it is

envisaged that DTs would be able to function fully as the DDMOs and moreover, RCSC may not support the appointment of new officers as DDMOs, as has been indicated in past discussions.

Action Plan: The DDM will continue to build the capacities of the DDMOs in disaster management through various workshops and training programs.

Timeline: June 2016- July 2017
Responsible Officials: Chief, Risk Prevention and Reduction Division (RPRD)

1.5 Lack of DM Plan

In line with the Government's policy of decentralization and also in line with international standards, the DDM initiated the CBDRM process which advocates a bottom-up approach for identifying risks and preparing DM Plans in the country, since local people know their risks and capacities best. Although DDM had conducted ToT on CBDRM in all 20 dzongkhags, in the absence of fulltime DDMOs, there was no one in the Dzongkhags to initiate the process of the actual DM plan preparation. Moreover, the DDM was waiting for the DM plan for Paro to be finalized through the CBDRM approach to act as a model plan for other dzongkhags. However, draft DM plan for Trongsa Dzongkhag and draft contingency plan for Gasa Dzongkhag have been completed by the respective Dzongkhags.

Action Plan: DDM will support the preparation of DM plans at the dzongkhag level in a phased manner. In the FY 2016-17, DDM will support and facilitate DM plan preparation for Chukha, Pemagatshel, Samtse, Dagana, Trongsa Dzongkhags and Phuentsholing and Thimphu Thromdes.

Time line: 2016-2017
Responsible Official: Chief, RPRD

1.6 Absence of DM Unit in Agencies

Action Plan: NDMA Chairman to issue notification to all Ministries and large private and corporate sectors to institute DM unit as per Section 66 of DM Act 2013.

Time Frame: 2016 to 2017 FY
Responsible official: Chief, RPRD

Exhibit A

Performance Audit of Disaster Management (May 2016)

Action Plan, Timeline and Responsible Agencies

2. Strategic Framework for disaster management should be instituted

The National Disaster Risk Management Framework 2006 (NDRMF 2006) served as the guiding document for disaster management in the country, until the enactment of the Disaster Management Act of Bhutan 2013. With enactment of the Act in 2013, NDRMF 2006 was repealed and the Act mandated DDM to formulate the Disaster Management Strategy Framework (DMSF). The Department accordingly formulated the DMSF in consultation with all relevant Stakeholders, especially GNHC.

The draft DMSF was submitted to National Disaster Management Authority for endorsement as required by DM Act 2013. However, NDMA had directed DDM to review and re-submit it in next NDMA meeting.

Action Plan: The Department will review and resubmit the DMSF in the upcoming NDMA meeting for endorsement.

Time Frame: 2016-2017 Financial Year
Responsible Officer: Chief, Rehabilitation and Reconstruction Division (RRD)

3. Effective inter-agency/sector coordination for disaster management should be established

The DDM functions as the National Coordinating Agency for Disaster Management in the country. To fulfill its functions, DDM has been coordinating and facilitating any disaster management related activities within various agencies. However, at the national level due to the absence of DM unit in most of the Agencies and Private Sectors, it has been a challenge for DDM to conduct sector coordination effectively. At the Dzongkhag level, due to the absence of full time DDMOs, there have been gaps in implementing DRM activities and coordinating among sectors within the dzongkhag. In addition, as there were no full time DDMOs till recently, the responsibility of convening DDMC meetings could not be fixed. Hence DDMCs could not be convened as required under the DM Act.

Exhibit A

Performance Audit of Disaster Management (May 2016)

Action Plan, Timeline and Responsible Agencies

Action plan:

a. DDM will set up National Emergency Operation Center which will serve as information and communication hub during disasters.
b. DDM will send out notifications to agencies and private sectors in accordance to DM Act of Bhutan 2013 to institute DM units in their organizations
c. DDM will send reminders to DDMOs in the Dzongkhags to conduct regular meetings as prescribed in the DM Act 2013. And DDMOs shall ensure that regular meetings are conducted.

Time frame

a. 2016 -2017 and 2017 -2018 FY
b. 2016 -2017
c. 2016 -2017

Responsible official

a. Chief PRD
b. Chief, RPRD
c. DDMOs all 20 dzongkhags

4. Updated information on disaster management should be maintained

DDM, MoHCA has developed two components of disaster management information system- Disaster Management Information System (DMIS) for pre-disaster assessment and DesInventar for post disaster assessment. All these systems have been customized to suit the need of our country.

DDM, MoHCA conducted training on DMIS for DM focal person and ICT Officer of all 20 Dzongkhags. However, the system could not be implemented successfully as planned, as DM focal person in the Dzongkhags kept on changing. The successor focal persons who were not trained could not implement the system.

Action Plan: The DDM will strengthen the above mentioned systems in the following manner.

4.1 DMIS

This is basically a system to keep record of relief items such as Search & Rescue and Telecommunications items; Infrastructure inventory such as Roads, Health, Education and Religious structures in the dzongkhags; Contact number of DDMOs and SAR team members and Officials trained on DM.

Exhibit A

Performance Audit of Disaster Management (May 2016)

Action Plan, Timeline and Responsible Agencies

Action Plan: DDM will review and integrate necessary requirements into the system and train DDM staff and Dzongkhag Disaster Management Officers. The DMIS will strengthen the NEOC as it will provide information to support decision making in the NEOC.

Time Frame: 2016 to 2018 FY (system review and update and DDM staff trained on it - on the condition the funding support submitted to the World Bank office comes through).

Responsible Officials: Head, Information Unit

4.2 DesInventar (Disaster Inventory System)

It is a conceptual and methodological tool for the generation of National Hazard Inventories and the construction of database of damage, losses and the effects of disasters. This system help analyze the trends of disasters and their impact, which will support the development of better prevention, mitigation and preparedness measures to reduce the impact of disasters in future.

The DesInventar system is a global system that was customized for our use. However, only the IT staffs have been trained to use it. Therefore, the DDM will review the system and strengthen the capacity of DDM/ DDMOs to use it.

Time Frame: 2016 to 2017 FY
Responsible officials: Head, Information Unit

5. Holistic study on the preparedness on disaster management should be conducted

Multi-hazard mapping and vulnerability assessments are carried out by relevant technical agencies in the country. The following technical agencies carry out the specific hazard and vulnerability assessment:

Exhibit A

Performance Audit of Disaster Management (May 2016)

Action Plan, Timeline and Responsible Agencies

Sl. No	Agency	Mandate (Nature of Hazard)
1	Engineering Adaptation & Risk Reduction Division, Department of Engineering Services (DES), MoWHS	Earthquake Vulnerability (National level)
2	Flood Engineering Management Division, DES, MoWHS	Flood (all major rivers)
3	Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS	Multi-Hazard (all Human Settlements)
4	Geotechnical Unit, Department of Roads (DoR), MoWHS	Landslide along National Highway
5	Department of Geology & Mines (DGM), MoEA	Earthquake (National level), Floods (GLoF) and Landslide (National level)
6	Department of Hydro-met Services (DHMS), MoEA	Flood (all major rivers), & Landslide, Windstorm, Fire (need based)
7	Forest Resource Management Division, Department of Forest & Part Services, MoAF	Fire (National level)
8	Soil Service Unit, National Soil Service Centre, Department of Agriculture, MoAF	Landslide and Soil Erosion (National level)
9	GIS Division, Thimphu Thromde	Flood (Thimphu city)

DDM facilitates those technical agencies in carrying out those activities whenever and wherever necessary. DDM has been working with DHMS, MoEA in carrying out flood hazard maps and vulnerability assessments for Punatsangchhu, Mangdechhu and Chamkharchuu river basins. DDM is also working with DGM, MoEA in installation of Seismic Stations in the country.

DDM also supports the capacity development of the above mentioned technical agencies, in an effort to develop hazard maps and vulnerability assessments by themselves. Relevant officials from those technical agencies were taken to IIRS, Dehradun, India in 2015 for a week long workshop on multi-hazard mapping besides several workshops and trainings on the same are being conducted in the country.
Considering inadequate human capacity, absence of GIS database and budget for development of hazard maps in the Dzongkhags for Disaster Management (DM)

planning, DDM is focusing on the risk mapping through Community Based Disaster Risk Management (CBDRM) approach, which is a conventional method but pragmatic and useful in the Dzongkhags. Examples of risk mapping through CBDRM approach is being epitomized by DM plans of Paro and Trongsa Dzongkhags. Accordingly, DDM conducted CBDRM in all 20 Dzongkhags.

Action Plan:
DDM will continue to support CBDRM approach in the Dzongkhags for hazard, vulnerability and risk mapping for DM planning. Moreover, DDM is also exploring external funding support for preparation of a multi-hazard atlas for the country.

6. Effective coordination mechanism for disaster related projects should be instituted

Agency related projects which require DDM's inputs and participation has DDM's membership on the project steering committee. However, in some cases where the work is of a technical nature, DDM does not have the technical capacity to be on the project board. In terms of the prioritization and allocation of resources, it is the GNHC who has the mandate to do that and which approves all projects/ programs. At present projects and programs does not come to DDM for approval.

Therefore, it's not within the purview of DDM's mandate.

7. Financial arrangements for disaster management should be reviewed

As mandated by the DM Act 2013, DDM, MoHCA in consultation with DNB, MoF developed the DM Financial Guidelines to enable DDMC/sectors to have timely and well-coordinated fund management for DM activities.

However regarding provision of a separate budget head for National Disaster Management Activities which would be managed and operated by DDM as per DM Act 2013, the Ministry of Finance expressed that pre-allocation of budget will hamper developmental activities as disaster is contingent in nature. MoF further stated that annually they allocate separate budget as "Disaster Emergency Relief Fund" under Department of National Budget, catering for such purposes.

Action Plan: This issue will be put up to the next NDMA meeting for further direction.
Time Frame: 2016-2017 Financial Year

Responsible Officer: Chief, RRD

Performance Audit of Disaster Management (May 2016)

Action Plan, Timeline and Responsible Agencies

8. Alternative financing arrangement for disaster management could be explored

Action Plan: As pointed out in the RAA report, 'establishing earmarked fund similar to environmental trust fund and health trust fund for long term and sustainable funding of the disaster management…', DDM also feels that such a measure would be prudent and necessary.

However, there are already existing funds that cater to disaster management relief such as Disaster Emergency Relief Fund under the Department of National Budget and His Majesty's Relief Fund under the prerogative of His Majesty. The Department can propose for the establishment of earmarked fund similar to Environmental Trust fund and Health Trust fund as pointed out in the RAA report, in the next NDMA meeting.

Action Plan: This will be put up to the next NDMA meeting for further directives.
Time Frame: 2016-2017 Financial Year

Responsible Officer: Chief, RRD

9. Appropriate policies and plans on fire safety measures should be developed

The Department of Disaster Management had initiated the Dzong Fire Safety Awareness Program after the Wangdue Dzong fire in 2012. The Department has carried out the Dzong Fire Safety Awareness Training in 17 Dzongkhags with participations of Dzongkhag Officials and caretakers of important Lhakhangs/Mandirs. During the training program, the participants developed evacuation route maps and emergency exits. Moreover, the Department has also issued 10 fire extinguishers in each Dzongs in all 20 Dzongkhags.

The Department in consultation with RBP has also developed fire safety key messages for public awareness and promotes fire safety measures such as installation of fire detection alarm and incorporation of fire exits in the buildings for private and public infrastructures.

Action Plan: Department has initiated pilot development of Disaster Management Plan for four monastic schools in Bhutan (Dechen Phodrang Lobdra, Phochhu Dumra Lobdra, Sangchhen Dorji Lhundup Shedra and Sangchokar Thorim Shedra), which includes the assessment of fire hazards and evacuation routes.

The Department had also proposed budget for Dzong Fire Safety Program for remaining three Dzongkhags in FY2016-2017 but the budget was not approved.

Performance Audit of Disaster Management (May 2016)

Action Plan, Timeline and Responsible Agencies

The establishment of Fire Department under RBP will be put up to the next NDMA meeting for endorsement. Once the current fire division is upgraded to Department, fire related activities will be carried out by this Department.

Time Frame: 2016 to 2017 FY (NDMA meeting)
Responsible official: Chief, PRD, DDM and SP, Fire Service Division, RBP

10. Capacity building in disaster management should be rationalized

In terms of capacity building in the Department, as DDM is a fairly new department and disaster management being a new subject in Bhutan, it is imperative that officials are trained in disaster management and related fields. Officials who have been trained contribute immensely in organizing and facilitating capacity building programs in the dzongkhags and sectors in CBDRM, SAR and other awareness and planning programs.
Allocation of budget for ex-country travel in RGoB is only for attending SAARC meetings and training and does not cover the cost of attending specialized training programs. Therefore projects funded by donors have capacity building components to supplement RGOB capacity building budget.

Action plan: The DDM has already come up with the HR Capacity Development Plan. We would also like to seek specific and concrete recommendation and clear guidance from RAA in terms of rationalize HR capacity building in disaster management in the country considering DM is a cross cutting issues and enhancement of DM capacity in other concerned agencies are not within the prerogative and purview of the DDM.

Responsible official: Director/Director-General of DDM
Timeline: Current FY.

11. Possibilities of insuring important government assets should be explored

Although this is a good recommendation, it requires government and indeed the Parliament's decision and therefore it is beyond the Department's prerogative.