Audit Report : Performance Audit Report on Delivery of OPD Services at JDWNRH (AIN: 14724)

Schedule of Audit : 1st March to 4th April 2017

Date of Issue : 22nd August 2017 **Period covered by Audit** : 2014 to 2016

Name of Agency (s) : Jigme Dorji Wangchuck National Referral Hospital

Recommendations		Recommendations	Action taken (as per the detailed action plan/report submitted by JDWNRH)	Status/progress of corrective actions taken by the audited agency (RAA's Further Comments)	Reasons for non- completion of action (RAA's Further Comments)
	4.1	JDWNRH should formulate strategic plan	Action taken by the JDWNRH	Partially Implemented	
		The healthcare system in the country prior to granting autonomy to the JDWNRH was found inept owing to unclear responsibilities and accountabilities within the Departments/Divisions/ Units under the MoH. The RAA observed that the JDWNRH does not have a strategic focus and direction. It has not	Planning Division under the JDWNRH was directed to draft the strategic plan and prepare ToR for Strategic plan document. (Refer: letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November 2017).	been prepared. However, operational plan of JDWNRH is not yet formulated. Therefore,	Plan, the recommendation is
		formulated its strategic and operational plans. The Hospital does not have a mechanism instituted to implement its 11 th FYP activities. Therefore, JDWNRH should formulate strategic and operational plans to enhance efficient delivery of healthcare	hospital is yet to finalize the plan. UN Office has committed to fund the publication of the strategic plan. (<i>Refer</i>	and the operational plan with RAA once finalized and	treated as partially Implemented. The recommendations shall be reviewed upon submission of the final Strategic Plans and

	services.	2018/misc/19/10835 dated 12/3/2018).		Operational Plan.
4.2	JDWNRH should Institute proper	Action taken by the JDWNRH	<u>Implemented</u>	
	internal control Mechanism			N/A
		The existing token system has been	The JDWNRH has decided to	
	The RAA observed weak controls in the	strengthened and ensured that tokens are	issue office order to	
	token and appointment system. There were	entertained in sequence. Further the	strengthening the existing	
	cases in the General and Medical OPD that	management has written to the hospital staff	token system and to ensure	
	patients were provided consultation Services	not to go to doctor's chamber, wards and	that tokens are entertained in	
	without availing the token. The cases were	other places to avail services without tokens	a sequence vide letter No.	
	also observed where diagnosis test were	as it delays the arrival time of doctors in the	JDWNRH/HRD/2017-2018/	
	performed for some patients without seeking	chambers.	misc/19/10835 dated	
	prior appointment. Moreover, there is no	(Refer: letter No. JDWNRH/Director-	12/3/2018. The management	
	special arrangements for patients referred	4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November	has also circulated an office	
	from far flung places for health services	2017).	order to curtail bypass in	
	particularly those involving very long	,	waiting and token system.	
	waiting time which range from 3 days to as	Further, the JDWNRH responded that		
	long as 46 days. The patients were found	special arrangement for the patients coming	Further, the Management has	
	visiting the doctors for consultation at the in-	from the Dzongkhags and other far flung	created a separate counter in	
	patient ward, diagnosis services centers and	areas are in place. A separate token counter	the main reception area as a	
	other medical facilities. Despite instituting	has been created in the main reception	priority counter to improve	
	the token and appointment system, proper	counter for the patients coming from the	the services for the senior	
	and systematic procedures were not	Dzongkhags and other far flung areas. It is	citizens, differently abled,	
	followed and proper controls not instituted	clubbed with the priority counter. Further	diabetic and patients referred	
	resulting in unsystematic practices in the	such patients needing specialist consultation	from the dzongkhag hospitals.	
	patient consultation process. Therefore, the	are provided necessary support like		
	JDWNRH should institute proper control	escorting them till the concern chambers	Therefore, the	

	system to provide transparent, effective and faster delivery of health services. For patients referred from other Dzongkhags and far flung places, the possibility of making special arrangements may be considered.	and diagnostic services. Registrations for such patients are also done in a separate register for the record so that we can further improve our services if required. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/HRD/2017-2018/misc/19/10835 dated 12/3/2018).	recommendation is treated as implemented. However, JDWNRH should monitor and further strengthen the token system as a continuous process.	
4.3	JDWNRH should develop strategies to	Action taken by the JDWNRH	Partially Implemented	
	reduce waiting time in the OPD and Diagnosis services	Strengthen the existing token and control system. (Refer Letter No.	The JDWNRH has started appointment system on a pilot	The recommendation has
	Despite having clear targets to reduce waiting time to 30 minutes for the patients availing OPD and 2 weeks in diagnosis services in the 11th FYP, the targets were either not achieved or not evaluated	JDWNRH/HRD/2017-2018/misc/19/ 10835 dated 12/3/2018. The QASD proposed to reduce OPD waiting time by using 8 steps Continuous	basis. The ENT department has started with appointment system since 1 st March 2018 from 9.30 am and 3 pm Monday to Friday and till	been treated as partially implemented since JDWNRH has started to pilot
	properly. There were no clear strategies developed against each target. Moreover, during the survey carried out by the RAA, majority of the respondents were in favor of having appointment system through Mobile Apps, display of information on doctors	quality improvement approaches. Step 1. Problem Identification and Prioritization Step 2. Understanding the present system Step 3. Analysis of the Root causes	1pm on Saturday. Further, two department namely: Medical Department and Gynecology / Obstetric Department will begin appointment system from 19 th	appointment system and has plans to replicate the same in other Departments if found feasible. The
	availability though TV monitors placed in the OPD Chambers and awareness on the OPD timing, customer care and many more. Thus, the strategies to reduce waiting time	Completed Step 4. Selection of best alternative solution Step 5. Solution Implementation Step 6. Evaluation of Results Step 7. Standardization	March 2018. Following the roll out and depending on the outcomes of	final implementation status should be intimated to RAA.

for each OPD service should be set clearly and the performance monitored timely. The turnaround time for each service should be evaluated and causes identified for those services performing poorly. On the basis of service evaluation, the new strategies should be proposed to enhance efficient delivery of OPD services.

Step 8. Self- Evaluation and Future Planning.

Current Status:

- 1. Step 1 to 5 implemented so far.
- 2. The QASD and ICT presented proposal to introduce appointment system and to pilot with few departments namely;
 Department of ENT, Gynae/Obs & Medical)
- 3. The department of ENT has begun Google sheet based appointment system on 1st March 2018.
- 4. Gynae/Obs and Medical department. Gynae/Obs will be beginning the appointment system on 12 March 2018 and Medical department will begin on 19 March 2018.
- 5. The "Google Sheet" is used for appointment purpose in the initial stage of the implementation phase, which is expected to be replaced by Electronic Patient Information System (EPIS).
- 6. The MRI unit under Department of Radiology and Imaging is already practicing appointment system. The

the pilot project, the JDWNRH has plans to standardize the appointment system in rest of Departments to enhance efficient delivery of services.

		Endoscopy unit under Medical		
		department is partially practicing		
		appointment system: patients are given		
		date of endoscopy and not time. (Refer		
		letter no. JDWNRH/HRD/2017-		
		2018/misc/19/10835 dated 12/3/2018).		
4.4	Doctors on-duty for OPD services should	Action taken by the JDWNRH	Not Implemented	
	not be assigned for multiple assignments			The RAA has not
		No response has been intimated to RAA on		received any
	The RAA learnt that the specialized doctors	this recommendation.		responses from the JDWNRH with
	in the Medical OPD also had to attend to			JDWNRH with regard to this
	emergencies and academic purpose in the			recommendation.
	midst of the consultation services. Thus,			10001111101101110
	irregular timing followed by the doctors on-			Therefore, the
	duty and frequent disruption of schedules			recommendation
	had led to increase in waiting time and			remains not
	hampered smooth delivery of their services.			implemented.
	Therefore, the JDWNRH needs to have			
	uniformity in scheduling of the doctors'			
	arrival and departure time rosters. The			
	doctors scheduled for OPD services should			
	not be engaged in multiple activities. All the			
	academic activities should be done before			
	9:00 am or after 3:00 pm to enhance			
	uninterrupted and effective consultation and			
	diagnosis services.			

4.5 **JDWNRH** should conduct Monitoring and Evaluation on a regular basis

As majority of the patients are crowded outside filter and medical chambers, the hospital management should ensure that the OPD chambers are open throughout weekdays to enhance a smooth delivery of healthcare services. The OPD chambers should not limit the number of tokens and the doctors should be present in the chambers from 9:00 am to 3:00 pm to provide quality time to the patients. This would help in avoiding unnecessary crowding outside the chamber and subsequently reduce the patient waiting time. There were cases of some doctors coming late in their chambers and leaving early which resulted in longer waiting time for patients. There was lack of monitoring over effective working hours of doctors in the hospital. Therefore, the JDWNRH should conduct proper monitoring and evaluation of effective working hours of doctors and number of consultations provided by them.

Action taken by the JDWNRH

The Management to carry out monitoring and support as per recommendation of systematic cascading for accountability. There will be scheduled and planned monitoring. Report will be submitted to the hospital Coordination meeting/ committee meeting for further necessary action. A format has also been developed for maintaining record during monitoring. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/HRD/2017-2018/misc/ 19/10835 dated 12/3/2018).

Management has started carrying out monitoring and support as per recommendation for systematic cascading for accountability. Do the planned monitoring and asked to develop format to maintain the record of monitoring which shall be further submitted to Hospital Coordination/HR Meeting. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/HRD/2017-2018/misc/ 19/10835 dated 12/3/2018)

Not Implemented

The recommendation basically requires monitoring and evaluation of doctors and the OPD services provided to the patients. While noting the action taken monitor on other administrative aspects, the response doesn't convey any concrete actions taken by **JDWNRH** regarding monitoring over effective working hours of doctors in the hospital and number of consultations provided by them as required by the recommendations.

RAA While appreciative of the various actions initiated monitoring and evaluation conducted, the recommendation has been categorized as implemented not the actions since does taken not address the requirement as per the recommendation.

4.6 **JDWNRH should institute Clinical Audit**

While there are no standard time requirements for the patient consultation, it was observed that longer queue of patients availing the specialist services had resulted in devoting lesser consultation time and not properly profiling and recording the history of patients. There were instances noted in the endoscopy unit, where patients had to wait for 3 to 46 days to avail the services.

In this regard, the hospital management should institute clinical audits to enhance measurement of clinical activities and outcomes. It would provide opportunities to confirm established processes resulting on expected outcome, but more importantly, it would highlight potential problem areas within the hospital. Therefore, the Quality Assurance Unit should also include clinical audits in order to capture information about day to day work of clinical practice, identify problems, consider and make changes and monitor progress towards improved patient outcome.

Action taken by the JDWNRH

QMS will develop the strategy. (*Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November 2017*).

Quality Division was asked to develop strategy to conduct clinical auditing. Although QASD proposed strategies below to start clinical audit, it could not be followed due to lack of standards in place or in record. Tentative plan for clinical audits between January 2018 and March 2018 has come up.

Therefore, instead, the office of QASD started collecting all the SOPs from the department and those who did not have SOPs were asked to prepare SOPs by end of March 2018. At the moment, six departments have SOPs. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/HRD/2017-2018/misc/19/10835 dated 12/3/2018.

Partially Implemented

The RAA has noted that six departments of JDWNRH currently have SOPs.

It is also noted that QASD in consultations with departments are in process of developing SOPs which will serve as a benchmark for Clinical Audits and gradually start clinical auditing.

Hence, the recommendation has treated been partially implemented since OASD is in process of developing SOPs to institute Clinical Audit. The detailed SOPs for all the Department should be formulated and implementation ensured.

4.7 Strengthen the Hospital Information and Service Desk

In absence of ToR, the Information & Service Desk only assisted in addressing enquiries related to the location of the Chamber and health care facility. The RAA observed that Information Desk were ineffective as the desk is not equipped with basic facilities required in the information and service desk such as; computers, internet connections, information on the availability of the doctors and officials on duty. It was also observed that staff on duty were most of time idle or doing some personal work without any additional responsibility assigned to them. Therefore, Information & Service Desk should also maintain information of doctor's availability, route map of the hospital and aid the general public in providing basic information about the hospital facilities. Further, the JDWNRH should formulate ToR for Information & Service Desk for its effective functioning.

Action taken by the JDWNRH

The ToR for the floor Managers had been developed. The Receptionists and the floor managers have also been given orientation after recruitment and trained in September-October 2017 as per their job responsibility for effective functioning. Provided two number of computers to the information with internet connectivity. Provided the information desk with information on the facilities available in the hospital, information on the availability of doctors and officials on duty. (*Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November 2017*).

HR Division shared information of doctor on leave and training with information desk. ICT office has arranged for laptops which were issued to Service desk staff on 1st March 2018 to disseminate correct information on where about of doctors. General Section has also been reminded to share information with information desk while doctors are on tour like medical

Implemented

The RAA noted that doctor's availability information is shared by the HR Division to the information Desk, which is ultimately communicated to the patients. Additionally there is ToR for information desk managers. This was verified during the visit of JDWNRH by the follow up audit team on 28th March 2018. The Information Desk is equipped with laptops and connectivity internet disseminate fast and correct information. At the same time, the follow up team came across "floor managers" who were deployed mainly to assist the patients while in the hospital. They also had other responsibility such as monitoring, repairs & maintenance. Therefore, the N/A

4.8	JDWNRH should provide public	camp. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/HRD/2017-2018/misc/ 19/10835 dated 12/3/2018). Action taken by the JDWNRH	recommendation remains as implemented. Implemented
	education on the prevention and first-aid care and awareness on the timing and healthcare services With advancement of the communication technology, the Hospital should take advantage of the platforms to provide public education on incidences of diseases, prevention and first-aid medication through documentary or other means of communications. The adequate awareness should also be provided on the timing and clear directions on various healthcare services provided to enhance crowd management.	Public Relation officer with support from the ICT division to do the following: • Enhance public awareness through some media programme on BBS on the timing and health care services available in JDWNRH. • Flash it on the television screens in JDWNRH. • Put it up on all notice boards and prominent places. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November 2017). The Expression of Interest (EoI) was called from the media firms through Kuensel and website to make video clips on the mentioned topics. The evaluation was carried out and the work of producing short videos has been awarded to the lowest evaluated firm (Etho Meto Pictures). The	team from FUCD & PSAD on 28th March 2018 noted that, works on the video clips relating to public education and awareness on timing and health care services are awarded and are being screened in the television. It has also been found that posters were put up on notice boards and at prominent places. Therefore, the recommendation remains implemented. However, the management should ensure the continuance of this initiatives.

		work had been awarded and as per the terms		
		of reference one month time has been given		
		to complete the work. Soon the video clips		
		will be ready for review and screening in		
		relevant media platforms i.e JDWNRH		
		television screens, Bhutan broadcasting		
		Service and JDWNRH Facebook page.		
		Important information and messages for the		
		patients had also been put on JDWNRH		
		Facebook page, notice boards and walls in		
		prominent places.		
		(Refer letter No. JDWNRH/HRD /2017-		
		2018/misc/ 19/10835 dated 12/3/2018.		
4.9	JDWNRH should develop robust patient	Action taken by the JDWNRH	Partially Implemented	The RAA noted that,
4.9	JDWNRH should develop robust patient information system to enhance informed	Action taken by the JDWNRH		The RAA noted that, the TOR for
4.9		Action taken by the JDWNRH ICT will develop the action plan and the	The current status of the	ĺ ,
4.9	information system to enhance informed	-	The current status of the recommendation is partially	the TOR for
4.9	information system to enhance informed	ICT will develop the action plan and the write up and share a copy with the	The current status of the	the TOR for procurement, installation and
4.9	information system to enhance informed decision making	ICT will develop the action plan and the	The current status of the recommendation is partially implemented since JDWNRH is in the process of coming up	the TOR for procurement, installation and
4.9	information system to enhance informed decision making In absence of Hospital Information System,	ICT will develop the action plan and the write up and share a copy with the Management by 27 October, 2017. (Refer	The current status of the recommendation is partially implemented since JDWNRH	the TOR for procurement, installation and implementation of
4.9	information system to enhance informed decision making In absence of Hospital Information System, the details of services provided and details	ICT will develop the action plan and the write up and share a copy with the Management by 27 October, 2017. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-	The current status of the recommendation is partially implemented since JDWNRH is in the process of coming up	the TOR for procurement, installation and implementation of electronic patient
4.9	information system to enhance informed decision making In absence of Hospital Information System, the details of services provided and details of patients were not recorded. Records	ICT will develop the action plan and the write up and share a copy with the Management by 27 October, 2017. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-	The current status of the recommendation is partially implemented since JDWNRH is in the process of coming up with ePIS which will help to	the TOR for procurement, installation and implementation of electronic patient information system (ePIS) has been
4.9	information system to enhance informed decision making In absence of Hospital Information System, the details of services provided and details of patients were not recorded. Records related to appointment and token were	ICT will develop the action plan and the write up and share a copy with the Management by 27 October, 2017. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November 2017).	The current status of the recommendation is partially implemented since JDWNRH is in the process of coming up with ePIS which will help to provide evidence-based	the TOR for procurement, installation and implementation of electronic patient information system
4.9	information system to enhance informed decision making In absence of Hospital Information System, the details of services provided and details of patients were not recorded. Records related to appointment and token were maintained manually without much ease of	ICT will develop the action plan and the write up and share a copy with the Management by 27 October, 2017. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November 2017). ToR for procurement, installation and implementation of electronic Patient	The current status of the recommendation is partially implemented since JDWNRH is in the process of coming up with ePIS which will help to provide evidence-based information for medical	the TOR for procurement, installation and implementation of electronic patient information system (ePIS) has been developed by MOH,
4.9	information system to enhance informed decision making In absence of Hospital Information System, the details of services provided and details of patients were not recorded. Records related to appointment and token were maintained manually without much ease of tracking and monitoring. A systematic	ICT will develop the action plan and the write up and share a copy with the Management by 27 October, 2017. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November 2017). ToR for procurement, installation and implementation of electronic Patient	The current status of the recommendation is partially implemented since JDWNRH is in the process of coming up with ePIS which will help to provide evidence-based information for medical intervention, research and	the TOR for procurement, installation and implementation of electronic patient information system (ePIS) has been developed by MOH, DITT and

Exhibit - A

			T	
	details of the patient instantly to the doctors,	Expression of Interest (EoI) for the		the process of
	provide quality time and avoid extensive	procurement, installation and		floating EOI for
	paper works. Therefore, as an apex	implementation of ePIS for the entire		procurement,
	healthcare institution in the country, the	county. The ePIS system will be		installation and
	need to develop robust patient information	implemented first in JDWNRH.		implementation of
	system was found necessary for ensuring	Once the system has been implemented it		ePIS for the entire
	quality care services to the patients.	will help to provide evidence-based		Country hospital
		information for medical interventions,		with JDWNRH to
		research and better decision-making by		implement the first.
		improving access to quality data.		
		In addition to overall plans and strategies		
		from MoH via electronic patient		
		information system project (ePIS), Medical		
		Record at JDWNRH with support from		
		Bhutan Health Management and		
		Information System (BHMIS unit under		
		PPD, MoH), have implemented with main		
		intention to aid JDWNRH to achieve a		
		robust patient information system. (Refer		
		letter No.JDWNRH/HRD/2017-		
		2018/misc/19/ 10835 dated 12/3/2018.		
4.10	JDWNRH should develop a	Action taken by the JDWNRH	Partially Implemented	
	comprehensive Standard Operating			The SOPs & ToR
	Procedures (SoP)	In order to ensure quality efficient service	The RAA noted that Quality	may be submitted to
		delivery, all the heads of divisions under	Management Division has	RAA for verification

	JDWNRH has separate SOPs for each	AFD will develop SoPs for their division	initiated actions for	and management
	department which are not comprehensive	based on their mandates, job description,	formulation of the SOPs.	must ensure
	enough to carry out its mandate. The staffs	Annual Performance agreement and as per	Further, it is also noted that	implementation of
	lacked awareness and knowledge on the	our 12 Five Year Plan formulated recently	QASD of MoH in	the same.
	existing SOPS. Therefore, the JDWNRH	with effect from 3-7 October, 2017. This	consultations with relevant	
	should develop comprehensive SOPs and	will be developed and implemented latest	departments is in the process	
	create awareness among the responsible	by April, 2018. Further, in order to develop	of developing separate TOR	
	staffs. The BES should have separate SOP	SoPs by the respective divisions, QMS will	to ensure quality healthcare	
	with detailed TOR to carry the work as per	facilitate a workshop on making SoPs by	and efficient service delivery.	
	the mandate, which will ensure quality	end of December. (Refer letter No.		
	health care and efficient service delivery.	JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473	The recommendation has	
		dated 30th November 2017).	been treated as partially	
			implemented since JDWNRH	
		Quality Management Division has given	is in the process of	
		half day workshop to all Head of Divisions,	formulation of the SOPs and	
		Departments and In-Charge. Some of them	detailed TOR.	
		have already submitted SOPs as shown in		
		earlier page. Further, all heads are asked to		
		submit the first draft by end of March.		
		(Refer letter No. JDWNRH/HRD/2017-		
		2018/misc/19/ 10835 dated 12/3/2018.		
4.11	JDWNRH should strengthen Biomedical	Action taken by the JDWNRH	Partially Implemented	
	Engineering Unit			The RAA is
	A LANDANA III ISBR	The Biomedical division had been asked to	The RAA has noted that,	appreciative of the
	As mandated by the National Health Policy,	draw up an action plan in order to	training on basic repairs and	action taken by
	the bio-medical engineering services were	strengthen the division.	maintenance are provided to	JDWNRH in for

created as a separate division under JDWNRH in 2014. Currently, the division has one engineer, three senior technicians and one helper. Two technicians were trained in the maintenance of basic errors in dialysis, X-rays and ventilators. No technician was found trained in maintaining highly priced equipment and the Hospital depends on external service providers to maintain this equipment. The BES personnel and end-users like echo-technicians should also be involved in the need assessment or pre inspections either during the procurement process or maintenance. Therefore, the JDWNRH should strengthen BES with clear SOP and detailed TOR of its roles and responsibilities which will ensure quality healthcare and efficient service delivery.

All the division heads had been asked to draw up action plan for their division relevant to the audit observations and share with the Director latest by 27 October, 2017. (Refer letter No. JDWNRH/Director-4/2017-2018/5473 dated 30th November 2017.

Draft service standard is finalized in collaboration with BMED, DoMSHI. Medical equipment inventory database is under progress but a list of inventory is already available in excel file. Development of SOP and ToR is in process. Training on basic repair and maintenance of ventilator, anesthesia and endoscopy is already completed. Repair and maintenance training on medical equipment is already proposed and submitted to HR division including for 12th five year plan. The validation of BP instrument, SPO2 monitor and NIPB is started since March 2018 by procuring a testing tool this fiscal year. Refer letter No. JDWNRH/HRD/2017-2018/misc/19/10835 dated 12/3/2018.

BMED staff and staff has also started to carry out validation of BP instrument since March 2018 by procuring testing tools.

However, SOPs are yet to be finalized. Until, the SOPs are submitted to RAA for verification, the recommendation shall remain partially implemented.

Further, it is also noted that proposal is also included in the 12FYP for repairs and maintenance of medical equipment and capacity building of BMED.

finalization of the Draft Service standard and development of SOPs and TOR.

The recommendation has been treated as partially implemented since BMED is in the process of formulation of the SOPs, detailed TOR and standards.