

ཀྲུལ་གཞུང་ཚེས་ཞིབ་དབང་འཛིན།

ROYAL AUDIT AUTHORITY

*Bhutan Integrity House*

Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources



Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources

# REVIEW REPORT OF PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

October 2022

*"Every individual must strive to be principled. And individuals in positions of responsibility must even strive harder".  
- His Majesty the King Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck*



རྒྱལ་ཁབ་ལྷན་ཁྲིམས་ཞིབ་དབང་འཛིན།  
ROYAL AUDIT AUTHORITY

*Bhutan Integrity House*

Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources



RAA/(AG-SP)/03/2022/ 063

Date: 25 October 2022

The Hon'ble Speaker  
National Assembly of Bhutan  
Thimphu

**Subject: Submission of Review Report of Performance Audit Report**

Your Excellency,

In accordance with Section 42(b)(2) of the Rules of Procedures of Public Accounts Committee, the Royal Audit Authority (RAA) has the honour to submit the review report of Performance Audit Report on Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System, AIN 17636.

Based on the Management Action Plan (MAP) and Action Taken Report (ATR) received from the Road Safety and Transport Authority (RSTA), the RAA has conducted the review. The status of the report as of 25 October 2022 is detailed in Exhibit-A enclosed herewith for kind perusal.

Thanking you and looking forward to Your Excellency's continued support.

Yours respectfully,

(Tashi)  
**Auditor General of Bhutan**

Copy to:

1. The Hon'ble Prime Minister, Royal Government of Bhutan for kind information
2. The Hon'ble Chairperson, National Council of Bhutan for kind information
3. The Hon'ble Opposition Leader, National Assembly of Bhutan for kind information
4. The Hon'ble Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee, 3<sup>rd</sup> Parliament of Bhutan
5. The Secretary, Ministry of Information and Communication, Thimphu
6. The Secretary, Ministry of Works and Human Settlement, Thimphu
7. Chief of Police, Royal Bhutan Police, Thimphu
8. Director General, Department of Roads, MoWHS, Thimphu
9. Thrompons, Thimphu and Phuentsholing Thromdes
10. Superintendent of Police, Traffic Division, RBP, Thimphu
11. The Director, Road Safety and Transport Authority, Thimphu

*"Every individual must strive to be principled. And individuals in positions of responsibility must even strive harder."*

*- His Majesty the King Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck*



ཀྲུལ་གཞུང་ཕྱི་ས་ཞིབ་དབང་འཛིན།  
ROYAL AUDIT AUTHORITY

*Bhutan Integrity House*

Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources



12. Director, Department of Occupational Standards, MoLHR, Thimphu
13. Director, Department of Medical Services, MoH, Thimphu
14. Assistant Auditor General, Thematic Audit Division, RAA, Thimphu
15. Office copy
16. Guard file

*"Every individual must strive to be principled. And individuals in positions of responsibility must even strive harder."*

*- His Majesty the King Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck*

## Abstract of Review Report

### Review of Performance Audit Report on Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System

The Performance Audit Report on Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System was conducted to assess the effectiveness in implementation of road safety strategies to ensure safe road transport system and determine the extent to which the government initiatives have ensured accessible, available and affordable public transport for the period covering from 1 July 2016 till 30 June 2020. The final report was issued on 6 May 2022.

The report contained 30 observations under eight broad categories and 13 recommendations which are aimed to address areas where issues were identified and guide the management to correct the deficiencies and problems.

After 1<sup>st</sup> review of Management Action Plan (MAP) and Action Taken Reports (ATR) submitted by Road Safety and Transport Authority (RSTA), all 13 recommendations are being initiated. As such, the recommendations have been considered partially implemented.

The statuses of the recommendations are attached as **Exhibit –A**.

# **EXHIBIT-A**

## **Review Report of Performance Audit Report on Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System**

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
4.1	<p><b>The MoIC should come up with the comprehensive surface transport policy to provide overarching directions to ensure consolidated approaches to developing transport sector.</b></p> <p>A safe, efficient, sustainable and inclusive transport system has become one of the common aspirations of nations around the world as it has a potential to play a significant role in contributing to most of the goals in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development that are relevant to food security, health, energy, infrastructure, human settlements and climate change.</p>		<p>Final draft of the Comprehensive Surface Transport Policy completed and submitted to GNHC on 31/05/2022 and it was cleared by the Policy and Planning Coordination Committee (PPCC) on 27 May 2022. PPCC is the highest committee at the Ministry level that reviews the policy of the Ministry.</p> <p>Seek government endorsement/ approval of policy for implementation.</p> <p>While the Ministry has completed the development of policy, the procedural standards for policy screening and approval has to be met in line with Policy</p>	Contingent upon approval of the Cabinet.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A comprehensive Surface Transport Policy has been developed, endorsed by the Ministry and submitted to GNHC for policy screening on 31/05/2022.</li> <li>• RSTA received comments from GNHCS on the draft policy on July 18, 2022. RSTA incorporated the comments of GNHC and re-submitted on 27/07/2022.</li> <li>• GNHC may now put up the policy to the Committee of Secretaries and subsequently to the Lhengye Zhungtshog for approval.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>It has been noted that the draft Surface Transport Policy has been developed and awaiting for its final approval from the government.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain partially implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, RSTA may share a copy of draft policy for RAA’s review and verification.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	<p>As noted through the review, the development of transport sector is governed by the Road Safety and Transport Act 1999 and its subordinate instrument, RSTA Regulations 1999. The current situation is characterised by fragmented approaches in developing safer, efficient, sustainable and inclusive transport system by different agencies having roles in different aspects of transport sector. Such situation is basically fueled by the lack of well-defined institutional framework delineating responsibilities and accountability amongst agencies. A rising number of vehicles and consistently high incidences of accidents, injuries and fatalities</p>		<p>Development Protocols of the Royal Government. Therefore, the implementation of this comprehensive policy will be contingent upon approval by the Cabinet.</p> <p>The Ministry submitted the policy to GNHC vide letter MoIC/PPD-04 (b)/992 dated 31st May, 2022.</p> <p>The MoIC has incorporated the comments of GNHC and re-submitted on 27/07/2022.</p>			

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	<p>raise concerns on public health. Despite persistent efforts of authorities in ensuring road safety management, the trend of traffic infringement and incidences of accidents do not show a decreasing trend.</p> <p>The Transport Policy 2006 is seen to be deficient in terms of addressing scattered mandates of multiple agencies and face challenges of forging an overarching strategy in the country. There is a need to give consideration for framing a single and overarching direction that consolidates and offers integrated approaches to various aspects of transport sector including freight through a revised Transport Policy. A multi thronged strategies</p>					



<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	through cohesive working system and effective collaborative mechanism with relevant stakeholders can only be achieved through such interventions. It should specify responsibility, authority and accountability and ensure organizational systems and structures and professional capacity to deliver.					
<b>4.2</b>	<p><b>DoR and RSTA should adopt coordinated approach amongst relevant authorities in planning, designing, construction and operation of roads to ensure minimum safety standards.</b></p> <p>The accidents due to conditions of road is one of the causes of death. Ensuring safer roads can be one way to reduce</p>	<p>i. In planning and designing road infrastructures (highways, urban roads, rural roads, access roads), the minimum safety standards must be ensured;</p> <p>ii. During construction, the quality standards must be constantly monitored to ensure compliance to safety standards in terms of</p>	<p>The three divisions: Design Division, Construction Division and Maintenance Division under the Department of Roads follow the ADB developed checklist and coordinate the design, construction and maintenance of roads within the divisions.</p> <p>However, in order to ensure minimum safety standards of roads, the</p>	<p>Date of implementation is by end of July 2023 and it is a continuous process</p>	<p>Upon the recommendation of the RAA and requirement of the prevailing needs the following actions were taken:</p> <p>a. DoR instituted a Road Regulatory and Safety Section under Maintenance Division from this Fiscal Year</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>While the response has been noted, there should be robust collaborative approach when designing and constructing road infrastructures such as highways, urban, rural and access roads. The DoR should specify and monitor the minimum safety standards to the relevant</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	such accidents. The minimum safety measures are therefore, desirable for all types of roads –highways, urban and rural. With fragmented roles of authorities in development of different roads in the country, there is apparently a diffusion of responsibility as far as addressing the safety needs are concerned. A robust collaborative approach could be attained in the following areas, amongst others:	technical specifications, alignment, gradient;	DoR and RSTA shall work closely in planning, design, maintenance of roads and for Road Safety Audits (RSA). The same has been proposed in the CSR initiatives especially with regard to the conduct of RSA.		with approval of additional human resource by RCSC. The mandates of the Section were drawn and DoR is in the process of streamlining the functions and responsibilities of the Section and implementing it in the field. b. DoR in particular and MoWHS has included the OHS 1 and 2 (Operation Health and Safety) in the upcoming contract documents and implementing in contract works. The implementation is strongly enforced by PMU and particularly being highlighted in the Standard Operating	authorities building roads such as Regional DoR offices, Thromdes, LGs, gewogs.  The timeline provided for implementation of recommendation is from July 2023.

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
					<p>Procedure of Monitoring of the Contract works by the Head Office.</p> <p>c. With the recent Civil Service restructuring and reorganization of the Ministries and Departments, the clear delegation of the regulatory responsibilities of the DOR and RSTA is being worked on and by 2023, lots of issues will be resolved.</p>	
		iii. The installation of signage, security systems like CCTVs, and infrastructure for traffic calming measures must be carried out in a more coordinated manner;	Stakeholder meetings to promote road safety through standard traffic signs and road markings where RSTA as a nodal agency will require relevant agencies to consult RSTA for identification of hot/blind spots and advise on the	June 2022 to December 2022	<p>- Stakeholder meetings at the implementation level to promote standard traffic signs and road markings were held in all the Regions under RSTA.</p> <p>- As an outcome, the Local Governments and the Department of Roads are to rectify all the signs and</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA noted the completion of review and rectification of traffic signs and road markings in Thimphu Thromde, while other thromdes, Damphu and Mongar will be completed in October 2022.</p>

## Exhibit-A

**Audit Report** : Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)  
**Date of Issue** : 6 May 2022  
**Name of Agency (s)** : Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP  
**No. of Review** : 1<sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
			appropriate signs and markings.		<p>marking deviating from the standards to avoid confusions among road users.</p> <p>- Review and rectification of traffic signs and road markings in Thimphu in coordination with Thimphu Thromde and Traffic police is completed.</p> <p>- Similarly, the review and the rectification of signs and markings in other three Thromdes, Damphu and Mongar towns to be completed within October 2022.</p>	<p>However, RSTA may share the similar plans and programs for rest of the dzongkhags as well.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the report of review and rectification of traffic signs and road markings for completed Thromdes should be shared with RAA for verification.</p>
		iv.Maintenance and improvement of existing roads must be based on requirement to restore required safety of the roads;			<p>- A committee called Road Safety and Traffic Coordination Committee (RSTCC) formed in 5 Regions under RSTA.</p> <p>- Agencies responsible for rectification will then be</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The formation of RSTCC in five regions and review conducted in Thimphu in terms of safety of roads have been noted.</p>

**Exhibit-A**

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
					<p>notified to carry out maintenance and restoration of roads as recommended by the committee.</p> <p>- RSTCC, Thimphu reviewed safety aspects of roads including footpaths in Thimphu.</p>	<p>However, RSTA should share the review report of RSTCC, Thimphu with RAA for review and verification.</p>
		<p>v. Continuous monitoring of operation of roads, annual reporting on the safety situations, trends and remedial work undertaken must be ensured for improving the safety of the road network.</p>		Continued	<p>RSTA in collaboration with Traffic Police monitor the safety of the roads regularly.</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>As proposed in the CSR initiatives with regard to the conduct of Road Safety Audits (RSA), it should be conducted regularly to assess the status of roads and restore required safety of the roads.</p> <p>The RSTA should share the RSA report and regular monitoring reports with RAA for review and verification.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
<b>4.3</b>	<p><b>RSTA/DOR should institutionalise the system of conducting road safety audits for all roads</b></p> <p>Road safety audit is part of road safety management that independently examines and assess the safety standards especially in terms of safety hazards/risks, traffic signs, roadside topographies, environmental risk factors and surface conditions of existing or future roads. A road safety audit provides valuable inputs for improvement of road safety. The Road Act 2013 mandates the DoR to conduct road safety audit. However, a system of conducting a road safety</p>		<p>A Road Safety Audit guideline has been developed by RSTA to institutionalize a system of road safety auditing, incorporating inputs from DoR, MoWHS on the guidelines.</p> <p>RSA will be conducted henceforth, as and when required, led by RSTA and involving experts from relevant stakeholders including DoR, LGs, etc. Capacity building for the same will also be initiated.</p> <p>A pilot road safety auditing (RSA) of AH-48 was carried out to study if the parameters under the RSA guidelines are comprehensive for RSA. RSA in 4 Thromdes focusing on the standards</p>	March 2022 to March 2023	<p>The Road Act 2013 mandates the Department of Roads with Road Safety Auditing. However, because of conflicting roles, RSTA has been conducting safety audits in collaboration with stakeholders.</p> <p>Road Safety Auditing of Thimphu-Gelephu PNH and Samdrupjongkhar-Tashigang PNH is being conducted with effect from 10th October 2022 as per the parameters mentioned in the Road Safety Audit Manual.</p> <p>The Road Safety Audit Report will be then submitted to relevant agency (-ies) for</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA appreciates RSTA for coming out with a Road Safety Audit guideline and carrying out the pilot road safety audits in four Thromdes.</p> <p>Similar RSA has been conducted for Thimphu-Gelephu PNH and Samdrupjongkhar-Tashigang PNH since 10 October 2022.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation shall be considered partially implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, RSTA should share the RSA reports with RAA for review and verification.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	audit is yet to be institutionalised. Thus, there is a need to institutionalise the system of conducting road safety audits to seek improvement on overall safety of the road networks. Such exercise should be initiated for all phases of planning, designing, construction, maintenance and operation of the roads as deemed appropriate.		of traffic signs and road markings. Audit findings will be shared with respective Thromdes for rectification.		rectification and remedial actions where necessary.  With the Civil Service restructuring and segregation of mandates between the agencies, this mandate of Road Safety Audit will become clear and unambiguous.	
<b>4.4</b>	<b>RSTA should initiate systemic improvements in ensuring safer vehicles.</b>  Safe vehicles play an important role in both averting crashes and reducing the likelihood of serious injury in the event of a crash. RSTA as an agency responsible for promulgating motor	i. In terms of promulgating vehicle safety regulations, there is a need to define safety standards for the vehicles imported and incorporate the requirements in the RSTA regulations to regulate import of vehicles based on these standards. The regulations should be	Since Bhutan does not have its own vehicle manufacturing plant, based on international trade practice, Bhutan has to recognize the standards and certification set by the international vehicle manufacturers as there may be possible ramifications from our trading partners/countries. RSTA will enforce minimum vehicle safety	July 2022 to June 2023	The standards and specifications for vehicles to be allowed for import is strictly implemented as per the Road Safety and Transport Regulations 2021.  With the implementation of Road Safety and Transport Regulations 2021 replacing the	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  Since the RSTA has been enforcing the regional/international safety standards while registering vehicles, the recommendation shall be considered partially implemented.

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	vehicle safety regulations, there is a need to assess and review the safety regulations and reinvigorate its enforcement and monitoring functions to ensure that vehicles that are used are safer in terms of meeting minimum safety standards and technical performance. Some of the areas that need attention to ensure safer vehicles are:	complemented by policies on technical safety, age limits, fuel efficiency, and environmental friendliness of vehicles;	standards based on the standards of the manufacturing countries.  These standards will be advocated with the vehicle dealers to ensure that substandard vehicles are not imported into the country.  These standards will be shared with the RSTA Regional and Base Offices for verification during registration.  Regional and Base Offices will use the standard for verification during registration.		Regulations 1999, vehicle standards and specifications are monitored stringently.  RSTA became a member of Asia Pacific Road Safety Organization (APRSO) in December of 2021. This has enabled the Authority to have access to standards and specifications of vehicles in APRSO member countries and therefore, allow for parallel recognition of such standards for vehicle imports. Therefore, RSTA has been enforcing such regional/international safety standards while registering vehicles.	However, RSTA should share the Road Safety and Transport Regulations 2021 and APRSO standards with RAA for review and verification.



<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
					APRSO recognized vehicle safety standards will be obtained and circulated to all Regional and Base Offices of RSTA and the vehicle dealers in the country.	
		ii. In terms of monitoring the safety regulations of the vehicles, the RSTA should: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- have proper and designated location for vehicle fitness testing to avoid risks to other commuters;</li> <li>- develop comprehensive fitness checklist for holistic inspection of vehicles;</li> <li>- provide required equipment and training to the MVIs to enforce the safety requirements of vehicles;</li> <li>- develop comprehensive checklist for pre-</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Strictly implement the requirement for roadworthiness certification as per the provisions of Regulation</li> <li>- Regular highway inspections and enforcement of regulations</li> <li>- Advocacies and awareness programs for targeted groups such as Taxi drivers, Bus drivers, Freight transporters, Office goers, etc.</li> </ul> Provisions Section 285 to 292 of the RST Regulations 2022 govern the issuance of permits to visiting vehicles. The	March 2022 to August 2023	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Vehicle roadworthiness checklists for passenger buses are developed and enhanced. This is being implemented with enhanced PDI/PAI.</li> <li>- Further, web-based GPS has been installed in 197 passenger buses for promotion of safety and reliability.</li> <li>- The Authority has completed drafting the proposal on outsourcing the motor vehicle roadworthiness testing system to eligible automobile workshops. This will help streamline and strengthen the</li> </ul>	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  It has been noted that RSTA in order to streamline and strengthen the roadworthiness testing and certification system for motor vehicles has drafted a proposal on outsourcing the motor vehicle roadworthiness testing system to eligible automobile workshops.  Similarly, the vehicle roadworthiness checklists for passenger buses are developed and enhanced.

**Exhibit-A**

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>departure inspections of passenger transport vehicles and ensure that it is complied with;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- inspect loading capacity of the freight vehicles by making effective use of weighing machines procured by the Authority; and</li> <li>- develop guidelines for processing route permits to the foreign visiting vehicles.</li> </ul>	<p>Regulations came into effect from July 1, 2022.</p> <p>RSTA is working on the feasibility of outsourcing fitness tests to private auto workshops due to facility constraints. The Authority will stipulate the requirement and the checklist of fitness and shall monitor for compliance if outsourced.</p> <p>MVIs were trained on fitness tests in India and Thailand as a part of capacity building.</p> <p>Further, in-house training for MVIs under the Authority on the conduct of fitness tests is scheduled for the fiscal year 2022-2023.</p> <p>Periodic pre-departure and</p>		<p>roadworthiness testing and certification system for motor vehicles.</p>	<p>Further, MVIs were trained on fitness tests in India and Thailand as a part of capacity building and similar in-house training will be conducted in the FY 2022-23.</p> <p>In case of Pre-Departure inspections (PDI) and Post-Arrival Inspection (PAI) of passenger transport vehicles, a comprehensive checklist has been developed and maintained in all Regional/Base offices and accordingly implemented.</p> <p>Furthermore, the RST Regulations 2022 which came into effect from 1 July 2022 governs the issuance of permits to visiting vehicles.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation shall be</p>

**Exhibit-A**

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			<p>post-arrival inspections of passenger buses with comprehensive checklists are being strictly carried out by Base Offices across the country.</p> <p>Daily PDI and PAI would entail huge delays in travel time of passenger transport buses. This will further adversely affect the efficiency of the public transport system. Therefore, daily PDI and PAI inspection will be supplemented with periodic comprehensive inspection of buses. For all the inspections, an appropriate checklist is developed and maintained in all Regional/Base offices.</p>			<p>considered partially implemented.</p> <p>However, RSTA has not mentioned regarding the inspection of loading capacity of the freight vehicles by making effective use of weighing machines.</p> <p>While the timeline for implementation of recommendation is until August 2023, the RSTA may share the draft proposal of vehicle fitness outsourcing, vehicle roadworthiness checklist along with the reports for passenger buses, PDI/PAI checklist and reports, and a copy of RST Regulations 2022 with RAA for review and verification.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
4.5	<p><b>RSTA should ensure stringent enforcement and regulation of private driving training institutes besides strengthening the current system of issuing driving license.</b></p> <p>i. In the existing system, learner’s license is issued to anyone who applies and has attained minimum age of 17 years on production of medical fitness certificate. After six months of its issue, the holder is eligible to sit for test (both theory and practical). In order to ameliorate the process of training and to ensure that the novices meet certain minimum criteria, knowledge and experience deemed necessary to drive vehicles, the licensing</p>	<p>- Introducing pre-learning course before issue of learner’s license on safety aspects, traffic signage, and laws and rules to ensure that learner possesses minimum understanding of safety aspects and skills to operate the vehicle in the designated places;</p> <p>- A complete question bank for theory test must developed to be used for tests. The theory test content should not be limited to traffic signage but also on operation of vehicle;</p> <p>- Learning hours and supervision by licensed drivers must be prescribed and monitored to ensure that learners have undergone minimum hours of practice before applying for full-fledged license;</p>	<p>Questionnaires will be available on the RSTA’s website for the general public to learn and gain driving knowledge and understand safety rules.</p> <p>In order to strengthen the current system of issuing DL, RSTA is developing a question bank, both in Dzongkha and English for theory tests besides standardizing the 3-5-point turn test.</p> <p>A set of 100 new questions developed and being used for theory tests.</p> <p>Questionnaires test drivers’ knowledge on traffic signs and road markings, defensive driving, right of way rules, drink driving laws and</p>	March 2021 to June 2023	<p>New enhanced RSTA website with questionnaires is being developed.</p> <p>This activity is also reflected under the IWP of ICTD, MoIC targeted to be completed by May 2023.</p> <p>The Department of Occupation Standards (DOS) in collaboration with RSTA conducted physical verification of driving grounds and as of now 17 out of 33 driving training institutes have developed their driving ground as per the technical specification of RSTA.</p> <p>Those institutes who have not met the requirements</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RSTA reported that a question bank, both in Dzongkha and English for theory test is being developed. Similarly, a set of 100 new questions were developed and being used for theory tests besides standardizing the 3-5-point turn test.</p> <p>Regarding the learning hours and supervision by licensed drivers, the Department of Technical Education has approved 103 hours. Out of the which, 80% is assigned to practical learning, and 20% for theory.</p> <p>Further, the Department of Occupational (DOS) in</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	systems must be reinforced. These may include some of the following:	- Ensure proper infrastructures are in place to facilitate proper practice of driving for both the self-learners and those trained by the training institutes;	<p>basic maintenance of vehicles.</p> <p>The dummy questions will be made available on RSTA’s website for aspirant drivers to test their knowledge on road safety and driving rules.</p> <p>Total learning hours as approved by the Department of Technical Education is 103 hours. Out of the total, 80% assigned to practical learning, and 20% for theory.</p> <p>Driving schools are required to have driving ground with proper signs and markings, giving the complete sense of an actual road.</p>		have been suspended from conducting Light Vehicle Driving until the driving ground is developed and approved by DOS.	<p>collaboration with RSTA has found that out of 33 driving training institutes (DTI), only 17 has developed driving ground.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation shall be considered partially implemented.</p> <p>However, RSTA should develop a short video that includes driving and safety rules, traffic signage, vehicle safety aspects for all applicants to watch before they are issued with learner’s license to ensure that learner possesses minimum understanding of safety aspects and skills to operate the vehicle in the designated places.</p>

**Exhibit-A**

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
			Identification of a government land to establish a driving training facility in Thimphu is being assigned to RSD under APA. The facility is expected to provide for learning for both institutes and self-learners.			RSTA should develop mechanisms to ensure that the learning hours is adhered to by driving training institute (DTI) through monitoring, besides establishing a driving training facility in Thimphu through identification of a government land for both DTIs and self-learners.  With regard to DTIs, RSTA should provide the list of DTIs for RAA’s review and verification.
	ii. In collaboration with MoLHR, the driving training institutes must be regulated to ensure compliance to basic infrastructural requirements, safety features of vehicles used for trainings, employment of instructors, use of		Appropriate standards such as requirement of driving training practice ground and other facilities have been developed for strict compliance by all DTIs. Monitoring of the same is conducted jointly by DOS and RSTA.	Ongoing quarterly activity	The Department of Occupational Standards (DOS) and the Road Safety and Transport Authority jointly conduct quarterly monitoring of the required standards of the DTIs.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  The conduct of quarterly monitoring of required standards of the DTIs jointly by DOS and RSTA has been noted.

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	highways for driving practices, and adherences to other requirements under the Act.		This activity is implemented in coordination with MoLHR who is the lead agency.		Additionally, the two agencies jointly tend to any complaints/issues regarding the DTIs as and when necessary.	However, the monitoring report for the same should be furnished to RAA for review and verification.
<b>4.6</b>	<p><b>RSTA should enforce Road Safety &amp; Transport Regulations, which restricts the drivers to drive for long distances and period of driving.</b></p> <p>Fatigue is a major contributing factor in crashes worldwide, which involve long trips and extensive periods of continuous driving, and in short trips when the driver has previously been deprived of proper sleep or rest. Fatigue driving occurs when a driver, after prolonged periods of continuous driving</p>		<p>This is being strictly enforced for public transport buses that travel continuously for more than 8 hours a day.</p> <p>Strictly monitor the implementation of the provision on restriction of drivers to drive for long distances and periods of driving.</p>	Ongoing	<p>The Head Office has issued a directive to all ROs vide RSTA/TM-10/2021-22/93 dt. 11th August 2021 to ensure that passenger bus drivers do not drive for more than 8 hrs.</p> <p>Further, an Office Memo was issued on May 31 2022 (RSTA/TDD-02/2021-22/698) to this effect.</p> <p>This is supplemented with daily PDI. With the rolling out of the online vehicle tracking system (GPS), it</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The response has been noted. However, RSTA should institute mechanism and require the passenger’s buses to have two drivers in case the travel duration is continuously for more than 8 hours a day or in case of only one driver, the RSTA should ensure that there is halt after 8 hours.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain partially implemented.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	experiences mental and physical functional disorder. For the safety of passengers travelling by commercial vehicles, the RSTA should enforce the maximum hours of drive as per the RST Regulations. In contracting the services of the public transport, it must be ensured that commercial passenger vehicles have substitute drivers for the journey/routes which generally involve more than eight hours.				will further improve monitoring of passenger buses.	
<b>4.7</b>	<p><b>RSTA should institute demerit point system for the traffic infringement cases.</b></p> <p>The RST Regulations specifies offences and corresponding penalty points for violations of the rules. Except for few</p>		<p>It is already incorporated in the RST Regulations 2022 and will be strictly enforced.</p> <p>Incorporated in the system (eRaLIS) for automatic recording demerit points without having to discuss in the committee meeting.</p>	Date of implementation from 1st July 2022 and it is ongoing process	Demerit point system for repeated major traffic infringement cases is being incorporated in the new eRaLIS 2.0 and is being implemented with effect from 1st July 2022.	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RSTA reported that they have incorporated the demerit point system for traffic infringement cases in the RST Regulations 2022 and eRaLIS and is being</p>



<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	<p>major infringements, the penalty points are only used for application of monetary fines and does not accumulate further to attract more severe penalties for repeat offenses. Even in major infringement cases, it was noted that the repeat offences have not attracted specified penalty as prescribed by the rules.</p> <p>In order to ensure appropriate road behaviours by drivers, there is a need for a more effective deterrent system by way of assigning demerit points for every offence (major or minor) that would accumulate over a period of time to impose stricter penalties and sanctions. It can either lead to temporary suspension or cancellation of driving</p>		<p>Repeated major traffic offenders would only be allowed to reinstate their demerit points for three times at most and then it shall be automatically cancelled as per the RST Regulations clause “157. <i>A License shall remain suspended for a minimum period of 12 months after which it may be reinstated. The reinstatement shall be permitted for a maximum of three times only.</i>”</p>			<p>implemented since 1 July 2022.</p> <p>However, the implementation for the same will be verified in the due course of time.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain partially implemented.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	licences for a specified period of time based on the threshold points specified. The conditions and process for revocation of suspension or cancellation of licences can also be specified. Such a system would facilitate to identify, deter and penalise repeat offenders and would go a long way in improving the road behaviours of the drivers.					
<b>4.8</b>	<b>Emergency Response system must be reinforced with Standard Operating Procedures that would render well-coordinated mechanism, and adequately equipped resources (equipment and human resource). RSTA, RBP and MoH should work on forming separate emergency</b>	-Form designated emergency response team comprising of officials from different stakeholders such as the Traffic police, Ministry of Health, Road Safety and Transport Authority and the DoR; - The emergency response should be trained and well equipped and made available round	RSTA will coordinate with the key stakeholders to develop Coordination SOP for responding to Road Traffic Accidents (RTA).  <b>Key stakeholders:</b> 1. RSTA 2. RBP 3. DMS & DOPH, MoH 4. Other relevant stakeholders such as DOR, Thromde,	15 September 2022 to 30 November 2022	Emergency response is being advocated during the annual awareness and advocacy programs. However, a Coordination SOP for responding to Road Traffic Accidents (RTA) is being drafted in coordination with relevant transport stakeholders.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  Since the Coordination SOP for responding to Road Traffic Accidents (RTA) is being drafted, the recommendation shall be considered partially implemented.  Meanwhile, RSTA may share a draft SOP with

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	<p><b>team to attain motor vehicle accident cases.</b></p> <p>The crash victims have a better chance of recovery, or avoiding death, if they receive quick response at the scene of an injury. This can be catered only through an efficient and well-equipped response team. In the current scenario, there is no designated specific emergency response team except for contact point to request assistance during emergency. There is a need for Standard Operating Procedures that minimally specifies the following:</p>	<p>the clock;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- A single contact point (universal number) throughout the country to request the response services and interventions to either to mitigate risk or initiate palliative measures by designated agencies;</li> <li>Maintenance of uniform and comprehensive MVA data for conducting post-crash analysis;</li> <li>- Mechanism to build information on emergencies and response actions taken for post-crash analysis;</li> <li>- Monitoring of implementation of SOPs.</li> </ul>	<p>Dzongkhag, insurance companies and DDM will also be involved where relevant</p> <p><b>SoP will specify key areas but not limited to the following:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Chain of communication (coordination among helpline Nos. typically 113/111 and 112)</li> <li>- Specify roles and responsibilities of each agencies</li> <li>- Team coordination among and within the stakeholders including identification of designated emergency response teams</li> <li>- resource, equipment and training needs</li> <li>- Mechanism to build information on emergencies and response actions taken for post-crash analysis</li> </ul>			RAA for review and verification.

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
			Monitoring of implementation of SoP			
4.9	<p><b>RSTA should review the need to have guidelines to drive public transport strategies and plans for enhancing social integration of vulnerable group in public transport services.</b></p> <p>This relates to social considerations for vulnerable groups in designing and planning the transport infrastructure as well as facilitating enhancement of social integration through public transport.</p>	<p>i) The RSTA should review the need to have appropriate guidelines on providing infrastructures and facilities that address the convenience of general users and that of vulnerable group for enhancement of community integration and reduce social isolation of persons with disability and of elderly people. The facilities provided must be to the extent possible, based on the ergonomic dimensions of intended users and also maintain provisions for additional specific requirements. This should also include safeguards against harassments and inconveniences that are</p>	<p>A guideline to this effect will be implemented in close consultation with stakeholders and implemented after finalization.</p>	<p>July 2022 to June 2023</p>	<p>“Guideline on functional requirements of passenger bus terminal” has been developed in July 2022 and approved which will be used during design of new bus terminals.</p> <p>The guideline mandates requirement of facilities for person-with-disability, safety and security etc.</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall be considered partially implemented since the guideline on functional requirements of passenger bus terminal has been developed and approved.</p> <p>However, RSTA should share a copy of guideline with RAA for review and verification.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
		created in using the transport services.				
		ii) Having a policy on fare concession for specific section of society like differently abled, elderly and children.			The fare computation model employed by RSTA has provisions for providing fare concessions for the children and elderly in public transport.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  While there is a provision of providing fare concession for children and elderly as per the fare computation model as reported by the RSTA, the latter may provide a report or data for such concessions, if any for RAA's review and verification.
<b>4.10</b>	<b>Thromde should make urban transport efficient to address the traffic congestions in urban areas.</b>  In order to address the needs of expanding population, the cities and towns require integrated transport plans. The efficient public transport		Improve and enhance city bus service operation in urban areas. In order to achieve this: - A total 69 city buses have been procured and are in operation in Thimphu and Phuentsholing Thromde - One electric bus for Thimphu is being procured through UNIDO funding		- Total of 148 City Bus Stops installed along the city bus routes (Ongoing) - 8 Bus shelter for users are built - 2 city bus terminals are under site development, one at Ngabiphu Terminal and another at Dangrina Terminal (Ongoing)	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  While Thromdes initiatives towards improvement and enhancement of city bus services in urban areas are appreciated, the efficiency in terms of reliability and availability of public transport is lacking in the current situation. This is

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	in the urban areas will reduce the number of private cars and ultimately reduce the traffic congestion and its adverse effect on the environment. As of now, there is no efficient public transport even in the capital city resulting in traffic congestion which is most discussed topics in the main stream and Social Medias. Lack of clarity in the governance structure of the urban public transport is one of the main causes for its inefficiency among other reasons. There is a need for an integrated approach in developing a transport plan in collaboration with relevant stakeholders and enforcement through constant monitoring by relevant agencies and authorities.		<p>- 10 additional buses were proposed to be procured in the FY 2022-23 however, the budget for the activity has not been approved.</p> <p>- City buses have also been provisioned to cater to the needs of PWD such as priority seats, ramps, etc</p> <p>The City Bus Services continue to strive for improved transport system within urban areas through efficient city bus services</p>		<p>- 11.2 km Road marking and median painting completed as of now (Ongoing)</p> <p>- 6000 sq.m of potholes rectification done</p> <p>- 5,000 plus Building address created with 13,000 Building IDs and shared to public</p> <p>- Completed an Inception Report for the pre-feasibility study on Public Transport enhancement under Bhutan Green Transport Project (Ongoing)</p> <p>- Service hours have been extended from 6:30 PM to 10:30 PM and furthermore, the CBS is looking at ways to extend it till 12 midnight</p>	<p>due to the fact that there is lack of integrated approach to planning and development of city bus services.</p> <p>However, with the completion of Inception Report for the pre-feasibility study on Public Transport enhancement under Bhutan Green Transport Project, it is anticipated that the traffic congestions in urban areas would be addressed.</p> <p>Meanwhile, RSTA may share the pre-feasibility study report on Public Transport enhancement under Bhutan Green Transport Project with RAA for review and verification.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
<b>4.11</b>	<p><b>Public transport should be made convenient and accessible</b></p> <p>In order to boost the public transport ridership, transport service should be designed in a way that it accommodates the service levels required by the public transport users. Despite being one of the most important determinants of public transport demand in the country, convenience is often neglected in transportation systems design and assessment of operational performance. This has resulted in the rise of private vehicles causing traffic congestion, compromising safety and environmental hazard. In order to provide convenient and accessible public transport services,</p>	i.Developing shelter at bus terminal, bus stops and taxi stands where the commuters can take rest comfortably while waiting for the transportation service;	<p>Guidelines for bus terminal facilities have been developed which will standardize the construction of bus terminals, bus stops, taxi stands etc.</p> <p>The guidelines will be shared with the LGs. Construction will be taken up by LGs as mandated by the CMI guidelines.</p>	Guidelines shared by October 2022	“Guideline on functional requirements of passenger bus terminal” has been developed and approved which will be used during design of new bus terminals.	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>While the development of guideline on functional requirements of passenger bus terminal has been noted, the construction should be taken up by LGs as mandated by the CMI guidelines.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	some of the areas that need special focus are:					
		ii. Making ticketing process more convenient with use of ICT such as e-ticketing systems, mobile apps, QR code using banking apps and other mobile apps;	In collaboration with ICT Division and bus operators, RSTA will be coming up with uniform e-ticketing system by using mobile apps/web-based app.	July 2024 to March 2025	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The e-ticketing systems using digital apps have been developed by most of the private bus operators and city bus services.</li> <li>2. The use of prepaid cards is being piloted in city buses which will then be rolled out to intercity buses.</li> <li>3. The groundwork for this activity, such as data collection, research on best practices, etc. is underway.</li> </ol>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RSTA, in collaboration with ICT division and bus operators are coming up with uniform e-ticketing system through mobile or web-based apps.</p> <p>The timeline for implementation of the recommendation is from July 2024 to March 2025.</p>
		iii. Maintaining reliable information on bus services availability throughout the country;	With the installation of GPS and integration of public transport system in the eRaLIS 2.0 will be able to maintain reliable	August 2023 to December 2023	- The installation of web-based GPS tracking system is completed in 197 passenger buses	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA noted the installation of GPS tracker in 197 passenger buses, bus information board in</p>



<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
			information on bus services		- Bus Information Board has been installed in the Thimphu Bus Terminal - Data on bus routes, passenger bus timings, PDI/PAI reports, etc. have been incorporated in the new eRaLIS 2.0 and is being updated continuously.	Thimphu bus terminal and incorporation of data on bus routes, timing, PDI/PAI reports, etc in the eRALIS.  However, it will be verified in the due course of time.
		iv.Provision of luggage rooms for keeping luggage of the passengers at bus terminals;	Where space permits, RSTA has provisioned a separate luggage room. However, because of the space constraint in most RSTA offices where the spaces are on rent, such provision is difficult to provide.  Further, the new guideline on construction on bus terminals mandate that any new construction of bus terminals must provide for separate and adequate luggage rooms. This will be used for any design and	Continued process	- Luggage rooms are provided in all of RSTA owned bus terminals. - In RSTA rented spaces, luggage rooms are provided, wherever possible. - Further, any new bus terminal construction is mandated to include separate and adequate luggage rooms as per the “Guideline on functional requirements of passenger bus terminal”.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  Since, the construction of any new bus terminals is mandated to include separate and adequate luggage rooms as per the guideline on functional requirements of passenger bus terminal, the recommendation shall be considered partially implemented.  Meanwhile, RSTA may share a copy of guideline

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			drawing approval by the Authority henceforth.			with RAA for review and verification.
		v.Constant monitoring of provision of comfortable seats, recess time, convenient lunch and breakfast point, destination information, etc. for passengers;	<p>RSTA will provide a bus information system through use of ITS supplemented by non-ITS interventions.</p> <p>As for points for meals, the choices are left to the passengers based on their affordability and choice of meals. It will be wrong for RSTA to determine which restaurant bus passengers should take their meals from.</p> <p>Further, with the provision of QR code in all passenger buses for passengers to raise any issues of discomfort, the Authority will be able to streamline and strengthen safety and reliability of passenger buses.</p>	August 2023 to April 2025	<p>- As stated in the MAP, the choice of meal points is left to the passengers based on their affordability and choice of meals.</p> <p>- However, a QR code sticker has been mandatorily affixed in all passenger buses with a portal for passenger bus service complaints for passengers to raise any issues of discomfort for the Authority to take necessary actions.</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The RSTA besides providing the bus information has affixed QR codes in passenger buses for raising any complaints and issues.</p> <p>However, RSTA may have to come up with the monitoring and action taken reports to strengthen safety and reliability of passenger buses.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		vi.Provision of transport connectivity and enhanced frequency to public services at identified locations for robust urban transit systems as well as rural transports.	The RSTA will conduct a needs assessment of public transport. Ongoing collaboration with LGs to enhance passenger bus services in rural areas to improve last mile connectivity through appropriate policy and fiscal measures including provision of subsidies for non-profitable routes.	July 2024 to June 2025	The groundwork for this activity, such as data collection, research, etc. is underway. This data analysis will be used for proposing policy and fiscal interventions to the government in the 13th FYP.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  The recommendation is being pursued by the RSTA.  The timeline for implementation of recommendation is from July 2024 to June 2025.
<b>4.12</b>	<b>RSTA should put in place regular monitoring of service delivery including complaint redressal mechanism</b>  RSTA should ensure that the services provided are accessible, effective, reliable and customer friendly.  This will ensure that quality services are provided while ensuring a safe and sustainable road	i. Monitoring and evaluation of performance as per Turn Around time (TAT) for range of services and reporting systems must be reinforced. Accountability for underperformance and strategies for improvement must be developed;	The Authority is constantly monitoring the provision of services to the general public in line with the TAT. The monitoring and evaluation of the performance is carried out twice a year. Additionally, with the up-gradation of eRaLIS, we have incorporated a clear framework for fixing individual accountability in terms of providing services as per TAT.	May 2022 to May 2022	The monitoring and evaluation of the performance of service delivery by RSTA is ongoing activity and a quarterly report on the same will be published starting 2022-2023 FY.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  The monitoring and evaluation of the performance of service delivery by RSTA has been noted.  However, the quarterly report of M&E for FY 2022-23 will be verified once it is published.  Meanwhile, RSTA may share the framework for

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
	transport system in the country. There are opportunities for improvement of the various services delivered by the RSTA. Some of the aspects to be considered for initiating improvements are:		Some of RSTA’s services are also boarded onto RCSC’s SET. This would further strengthen monitoring of service delivery by an external agency like RCSC.			fixing individual accountability with RAA for review and verification.
		ii. Leverage ICT for eRALIS and online payment system and accordingly increase its daily intake of service. In addition, RSTA should look into alternatives where the physical requirement of people to avail services should be minimal once initiated through online platform;	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Digitization of services leading to reduction in TAT (10 of the RSTA's services have been made available online through eRaLIS)</li> <li>- Driving tests schedules have been increased</li> <li>- Front desk employees have been trained on service delivery at FITI and another batch of employees was also trained on Empathy</li> <li>- The operating time for cash counters has been extended from 3 pm to 5 pm.</li> <li>- Priority counters for senior</li> </ul>	Continued process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- All RSTA services are based on electronic Registration and Licensing Information System (eRaLIS). Therefore, RSTA is already into full-fledged technology.</li> <li>- However, we have enhanced our online payment system with the new eRaLIS which is being implemented with effect from July 2022.</li> <li>- Furthermore, we have created a separate CD account for RSTA to minimize cash-handling during revenue collection</li> </ul>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RSTA reported that a total of 10 services are made online, besides extension of office at Babesa.</p> <p>However, RAA shall verify the improvements in the service delivery in the due course of time.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b> : Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636) <b>Date of Issue</b> : 6 May 2022 <b>Name of Agency (s)</b> : Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP <b>No. of Review</b> : 1 <sup>st</sup> Review						
Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
			citizens and Persons with Special Needs have been set up in all Regional and Base Offices - In Thimphu, an extension office has been set up in Babesa to take service nearer to people for their convenience. - Revamp the eRALIS system to promote reliability and efficiency in the provision of online services. - Promote cashless transactions by enabling payments through banking apps such as mBoB, mPAY, etc.		for the services through digital payment facility such mBOB, mPAY etc and is being implemented since August 2022.  System enhancement for eRaLIS with added features was completed and launched by the Ministry on 13/10/2022.  This enhanced system will provide better data quality and reliability.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  The enhancement of eRaLIS system has been noted.  However, the system will be verified in the due course of time.
		iii. System enhancement is required for eRALIS especially the incorporation of input validation in the system and data cleaning;				
		iv. The forms used for services provided should be available in both Dzongkha and English thereby encouraging the service users to use the services without being dependent;	While the Authority is trying to minimize the need for a document and forms in order to reduce administrative burden and to digitize most of the services, where required and on a need basis, the form is being revised for easy usage by the clients.	Date of implementation is by December 2022 and ongoing process	The forms have been revised and are ready for implementation in English However, translation into Dzongkha is underway.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  RSTA has revised the English forms and further in the process of translating in Dzongkha.

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
			<p>With putting in place the revised form, the client will not have to fill/provide repeated information if any individual already holds either of LL/DL or has a vehicle registered with the Authority.</p> <p>At the later stage, the form will also be translated &amp; made available in Dzongkha as well.</p>			
		v. Establish Grievance and Redressal System to address grievances of service users and develop strategies for future improvements.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- An online platform for grievance redressal will be developed and launched on RSTA’s website by December 2022.</li> <li>- Feedback boxes are installed in all the Regional Offices</li> <li>- rsta@rsta.gov.bt is being put in place to address the grievance/queries of the service users.</li> <li>- RSTA has identified focal officials from each</li> </ul>	Date of implementation is from September 2022 and practiced continuously unless some other options is put in place	<p>A portal for passenger bus service complaints has been designed and implemented.</p> <p>For this, a QR sticker is displayed in all buses from where passengers can provide feedback and complaints.</p> <p>The RSTA email ID <a href="mailto:rsta@rsta.gov.bt">rsta@rsta.gov.bt</a> continues</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>While the online platform for grievance redressal will be developed and launched on RSTA’s website by December 2022, the QR codes are being displayed in all the passenger buses for providing feedbacks and complaints, besides installation of feedback</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
			regional office to attend to the queries & grievances. - RSTA will also install QR scan codes in Passenger Buses w.e.f. September 2022 for passengers to share complaints/ grievances		to be a source of complaint redressal on a daily basis.  Feedback boxes are also installed in all the Regional Offices.	boxes in all the regional offices.  However, RSTA may have to come up with the report on Grievance and Redressal System for future improvements.
<b>4.13</b>	<b>There is a need to address the risk of pollutions related to vehicles</b>  The growing number of vehicles in the country is fueling concerns on environment and the impending risks that imposes needs to be mitigated through various measures. The damage to environment brought about by vehicular emissions needs consideration of the policy makers on priority basis. Some of the areas	i. The RSTA in collaboration with NEC should adopt appropriate vehicle emission standards and proper monitoring/ inspection system to regulate compliances;	A total of 300 ICE taxis will be replaced by EV taxis through the UNDP-GEF project.  Funded by the UNIDO, one electric bus and two charging stations will be procured by the City Bus Services for operation on pilot basis in Thimphu Thromde. The EV Roadmap (2020-2035) will be finalized, government approval sought and operationalized jointly by MoIC and PMU, PMO.	Completed by June 2023	Out of the 300 EV Taxis, 188 are currently on road. 112 EVs have been ordered and are in transit.  Procurement of one electric bus is in transit. The payment will be made upon delivery and testing in Thimphu. Site selection for electric bus charging stations is completed and BPC is currently installing 3 transformers for the same.	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  It has been noted that various initiatives are being taken in reducing the vehicle emissions, such as replacing fossil fuel taxis with EV cars, procurement of EV bus and installation of charging stations.  However, until we achieve full energy efficient mode of transport system, it is imperative that appropriate vehicle emission standards and proper monitoring/ inspection system should be adopted.

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	that need to be focused are:		<p>Installation of Charging stations in 14 Dzongkhag</p> <p>With support from the Government of Japan and UNDP, EV PMU will be procuring 19 EVs for the RGoB fleet and 8 DC charging stations, to be installed at strategic locations by the end of May 2023.</p> <p>The emission testing of vehicles has been awarded to two private firms in July 2021.</p>		<p>The draft EV Roadmap (2020-2035) is being reviewed jointly by the relevant stakeholders such as the PMU under PMO, the BPC and RSTA and will be finalized for government approval by the end of December 2022. The team is also working closely with an international consultant engaged by UNIDO.</p> <p>The work for procurement of 16 DC and 15 AC machines, the construction of EV shed and construction of substation has been awarded. The machines have arrived in Thimphu and the overall installation and commissioning is projected to be completed</p>	



**Audit Report** : Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)  
**Date of Issue** : 6 May 2022  
**Name of Agency (s)** : Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP  
**No. of Review** : 1<sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
					<p>by the end of December 2022.</p> <p>The production for the 19 EVs has begun from October 2022 and the EVs are projected to be delivered by February 2023. For the installation of 8 DC Charging Stations, a TWG has been formed and an implementation plan for the project is currently being drafted.</p> <p>With the emission testing centers operationalized, the emission test certificate is being verified during the vehicle fitness testing for Road Worthiness Certificate (RWC) renewal.</p>	

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		ii.Noise pollution caused by vehicles also have also become a concern to both the human and wildlife. There is a need to lay down permissible noise level and monitor its compliance on a regular basis.	<p>The strategies to curb the problem of vehicular noise pollution is included in the revised Road Safety and Transport Regulations 2021.</p> <p>Chapter VII, section 451 states “A person shall not drive or allow a motor vehicle to be driven on a road that produces undue noise or noise beyond the permissible level set by the National Environment Commission”.</p>	<p>The implementation revised RST Regulations started with effect from 1st July 2022. The standard setting shall be requested from NEC within June 2023.</p> <p>Continue to implement and ensure compliance with the provision of Regulations until the same is repealed or revoked.</p>	<p>Monitoring on noise pollution in vehicles, esp. Two Wheelers have been carried out in Thimphu. A team from the Regulatory &amp; Safety Division carried out an inspection on noise pollution from 20th July, 2022.</p> <p>A notification has been issued to Automobile Association vide letter No. RSTA/RSD-17/2021-2022/40, dated 19/07/2022 to inform local workshops to abide by the RST Regulations and not to carry out modification of exhaust pipes in motorbikes. Additionally, Vehicle dealers were informed on the same.</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The monitoring on noise pollution particularly for two wheelers and notification sent to Automobile Association have been noted.</p> <p>However, until the procurement of Vehicle Noise Measurement Device and permissible noise level set, the monitoring of its compliance would not possible.</p> <p>As such, RSTA should expediate in the procurement of devices and inspect vehicles for noise pollution beyond the permissible level as a part of their highway inspection program.</p>

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Sub recommendation	Management Action Plan	Timeline	Action Taken	Status of Review
					Vehicle Noise Measurement Device procurement is under process. Devices will be distributed to Base, Regional Offices and RBP, Traffic Division for enforcement.	
		iii. Abandoned vehicles and machineries along the highways causes obstructions to the drivers and compromise safety concerns. Further, it creates environment hazard in terms of compromising aesthetics of the place and hazardous chemicals emitted by it. The RSTA in collaboration with DoR should enforce its regulation in removing abandoned vehicles and	Following provisions of RST Regulations addresses this issue, “374. <i>A person leaving a motor vehicle unattended shall park the vehicle properly, switch off the engine, apply parking brakes, and lock the vehicle to ensure safety of other road users. 375. In case of an accident occurring due to unattended vehicles, causing death, injury or property damage, the owner of the vehicle parked unsafely shall be liable for the payment of compensation as per the Road Safety and Transport</i>	Ongoing	The Department of Roads implements the Right of Way (RoW) on primary and secondary national highways. For abandoned vehicles and machinery along such highways, the DoR, LG, RSTA and Traffic Police collaborate to trace the owner of these vehicles and have them relocate these vehicles.  This will become clearer once the Surface Transport Policy is approved by the	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  While there are provisions with regard to abandoned vehicles and machineries in RST Regulations and Road Safety and Transport Act 1999, the implementation of the same is paramount importance.  As such, the RSTA should share a report of abandoned vehicles and machineries with RAA for review and verification.

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>machineries that may compromise the safety of road users.</p>	<p><i>Act 1999 or as may be determined by the court unless proven otherwise. 376. A motor vehicle may be towed by a competent authority if a vehicle is found to be parked in a place causing traffic obstruction or safety hazard to other road users”.</i></p> <p>Interventions on removal of such abandoned vehicles are addressed as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Along PNH and SNH highways, abandoned vehicles are towed/lifted/penalized by DoR based on road right-of-way</li> <li>2. Within urban areas, abandoned vehicles are towed/lifted/penalized by LGs based on right-of-way and local area plans.</li> </ol>		<p>Government and a Scrappage Policy developed as one of the outcomes of the Surface Transport Policy.</p>	

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report of Safe and Sustainable Road Transport System (AIN 17636)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 6 May 2022
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Road Safety and Transport Authority and Traffic Division, RBP
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 1 <sup>st</sup> Review

<b>Rec. No.</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Sub recommendation</b>	<b>Management Action Plan</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			3. Similarly, RSTA undertook a major exercise in this regard. From May-December 2021, close to 40,000 vehicle ownerships have been affected. This also included deregistration of abandoned/scrapped vehicles. This exercise is continued and, therefore, is expected to address the issue of abandoned vehicles along highways and in other public places.			

\*\*\*\*\*

