

Audit Report : Report on Performance Audit of Disaster Management in Bhutan
Schedule of Audit : 1st September 2015 to 31st January 2016
Date of Issue : May 2016
Period covered by Audit : 2010 to 2015
Name of Agency : Department of Disaster Management

Sl. No.	Recommendation	Action taken (as per the detailed action Plan attached as Annexure A to this follow-up report).	Status/Progress of corrective actions taken by the audited agency (RAA's further comments)	Reasons for non-completion of action on any recommendations
1	<p>1. ENFORCEMENT OF PROVISION OF DISASTER MANAGEMENT ACT 2013 SHOULD BE ENSURED</p> <p><i>Review of provisions of the Disaster Management Act and its implementation showed that the Act had not been enforced in earnest. Most of the provisions of the Act were not enforced at all. The DDM, as the nodal agency for disaster management in the country, should ensure enforcement and implementation of the provisions of the Act in consultation with relevant authorities. Besides, the DDM, under the directives of the NDMA should also establish the institutions envisaged in the Act for effective disaster management.</i></p>	<p>Conducted four meetings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1st Meeting : 19th March 2014, • 2nd Meeting: 30th October 2014, • 3rd Meeting : 22nd April 25th April 2017 and • 4th meeting : 4th January 2017; <p><i>Details of activities undertaken are as given in Annexure A</i></p>	<p><u>Partially Implemented:</u></p> <p><i>The DDM reported to have conducted four meetings in accordance to the action plans submitted.</i></p> <p><i>However, there is no mention of other activities as indicated in the recommendations.</i></p>	N/A
2	<p>2. STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK FOR DISASTER MANAGEMENT SHOULD BE INSTITUTED</p> <p><i>The DDM lacks a comprehensive strategic framework for disaster management. The DDM should, therefore, develop strategic policy document, including inter-alia, strategies, vision, policies, clear roles and responsibilities that would guide different agencies in managing disaster.</i></p>	<p><i>Disaster Management Strategy Framework was submitted to NDMA during its 4th NDMA meeting and endorsed.</i></p>	<p><u>Implemented</u></p> <p><i>Strategy Framework prepared and endorsed.</i></p>	N/A

<p>3</p>	<p>3. EFFECTIVE INTER-AGENCY/SECTOR COORDINATION FOR DISASTER MANAGEMENT SHOULD BE ESTABLISHED</p> <p><i>Disaster management being a cross-cutting issue requires coordination and cooperation amongst multiple agencies. There was, however, lack of effective coordination and cooperation amongst various agencies. The DDM, as the nodal agency, should play a pivotal role in promoting greater coordination and cooperation amongst all relevant agencies for a holistic and coordinated approach to disaster management.</i></p>	<p><i>Completed construction of pre-fab. NEOC and Procured basic equipment.</i></p> <p><i>The executive order from NDMA has been sent vide DDM/MoHCA/Misc/2016-17/335 dated 28th September 2016 to agencies / sectors to institute DM unit in their respective agencies.</i></p> <p><i>Accordingly, few agencies such as MoH, MoE, MoFA, MoEA, MoWHS, RAA and Thimphu Phuentsholing and Gelephu Thromde have formed DM unit.</i></p>	<p><u>Partially Implemented</u></p> <p><i>The DDM has reportedly opened the disaster management in some selected agencies.</i></p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>4</p>	<p>4. UPDATED INFORMATION ON DISASTER MANAGEMENT SHOULD BE MAINTAINED</p> <p><i>Updated and adequate information is critical for effective planning, decision making and allocation of resources. The DDM, however, lacked complete and updated information on disaster management and related activities. The DDM should maintain updated information on all disaster-related activities in the country.</i></p>	<p><i>DDM has drafted the TOR for recruitment of consultant to review existing system in DDM and develop DMIS and DesInventar (Disaster Inventory System) to maintain up to date disaster information.</i></p>	<p><u>Partially Implemented</u></p> <p><i>The DDM has reportedly drafted the TOR for recruitment of consultant to review existing system in DDM and develop DMIS.</i></p> <p><i>However, actual review of the system has not happened.</i></p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>5</p>	<p>5. HOLISTIC STUDY ON THE PREPAREDNESS ON DISASTER MANAGEMENT SHOULD BE CONDUCTED</p> <p><i>Hazard zonation and vulnerability assessment are prerequisites for planning and focusing efforts towards disaster preparedness. The country does not have this fundamental requirement such as the hazard zonation maps and vulnerability reports on various disasters.</i></p>	<p><i>Due to lack of human capacity and budget and also absence of GIS database, DDM has focused on Community Based Disaster Risk Management (CBDRM), which a conventional yet pragmatic tool that holistically look into hazards,</i></p>	<p><u>Partially implemented</u></p> <p><i>The DDM has reported to have undertaken various activities as a compliance to the recommendations.</i></p>	<p>N/A</p>

	<p>The DDM should, therefore, ensure that such basic information and reports are prepared sooner so that resources and efforts can be directed appropriately to the most vulnerable areas.</p>	<p>vulnerability and risk map for DM planning. Thus DDM has been focusing on it to come up with DM plans from various Dzongkhags.</p> <p>DDM is also exploring external funds to support preparation of a multi-hazard atlas for the country.</p>	<p>However, actual implementation of action plan could not be commented as field verifications were not conducted.</p>	
6	<p>EFFECTIVE COORDINATION MECHANISM FOR DISASTER RELATED PROJECTS SHOULD BE INSTITUTED</p> <p>The disaster-related projects were found implemented by various agencies in isolation. The DDM did not have records of the projects implemented by other agencies. Since such documents are essential for proper coordination, the DDM should institute an appropriate coordination mechanism to capture the records and information of disaster related projects implemented in the country. This would also facilitate prioritization and allocation of resources.</p>	<p>No response on the Action taken:</p>	<p>Not Implemented</p> <p>RAA asserts that DDM being the Nodal Agency for Disaster Management should have proper information for coordination and planning purposes.</p>	<p>DDM states that it's not within the purview of DDM's mandate to coordinate projects and programs since such projects do not come to DDM for approval.</p>
7	<p>FINANCIAL ARRANGEMENTS FOR DISASTER MANAGEMENT SHOULD BE REVIEWED</p> <p>The Disaster Management Act required that a separate budget styled as Budget for National Disaster Management Activities shall be established, managed and operated by the DDM. The same was, however, not established and funds were provided as and when required, which was in deviation to the provision of the Disaster Management Act. The DDM, MoF and concerned authorities should review the current practice of funding for disaster management activities to ensure compliance to the Act.</p>	<p>Disaster Management Financial Guidelines was developed jointly by DDM and DNB, MoF and submitted to 3rd NDMA.</p> <p>The NDMA has directed DDM to submit to MoF for endorsement. Accordingly, the DDM has submitted the guidelines to DNB, MoF for endorsement via letter No. MoHCA/DDM/(M-01)/2016/-17/521 dated 1st December 2016.</p>	<p>Partially implemented</p> <p>The final endorsement has not come into effect.</p>	<p>N/A</p>

8	<p>8. ALTERNATIVE FINANCING ARRANGEMENT FOR DISASTER MANAGEMENT COULD BE EXPLORED</p> <p><i>Our country is geo-physically vulnerable to multiple hazards posing varying degrees of threat to lives and livelihood of the people. It would seem prudent and necessary to establish earmarked fund similar to environmental trust fund and health trust fund for the long-term and sustainable funding of the disaster management operations and activities. Therefore, an alternative financing arrangement, such as the establishment of trust funds for disaster management could be explored.</i></p>	<p><i>The NDMA has directed DDM and DNB to look into the guidelines and see the possibilities of capturing this issue in it.</i></p>	<p><u>Not Implemented</u></p>	<p><i>The RAA has not been intimated on the outcome.</i></p>
9	<p>APPROPRIATE POLICIES AND PLANS ON FIRE SAFETY MEASURES SHOULD BE DEVELOPED</p> <p><i>Despite clear requirements under the Bhutan Building Rules 2002 to have adequate fire safety measures, most buildings including Dzongs, monuments and schools do not have such safety measures or plans in place thereby posing fire hazard threats to lives and properties.</i></p> <p><i>The DDM and relevant authorities should enforce the fire safety regulations in all earnestness as fire is one of the regular hazards plaguing the country.</i></p>	<p><i>As per the Action plan the DDM stated that the Department has initiated pilot development of Disaster Management Plan for four monastic schools in Bhutan and has proposed budget for Dzong Fire Safety Program for remaining three Dzongkhags in FY2016-2017 but the budget was not approved.</i></p> <p><i>Furthermore, the Department has issued 10 fire extinguishers in each Dzong in all 20 Dzongkhags</i></p>	<p><u>Partially Implemented:</u></p> <p><i>The DDM has reported to have undertaken various activities as a compliance to the recommendations.</i></p> <p><i>However, actual implementation of action plan could not be commented as field verifications were not conducted.</i></p>	<p>N/A</p>
10	<p>CAPACITY BUILDING IN DISASTER MANAGEMENT SHOULD BE RATIONALIZED</p> <p><i>Capacity building is one of the integral components of successful disaster management. While most of the officials of the DDM had been trained on disaster management in varied subjects, there was no appropriate strategy and plans in managing this pool of human resources. Further, every donor-funded</i></p>	<p><i>According to DDM, Human Resource Capacity Development Plan has been prepared.</i></p>	<p><u>Partially Implemented:</u></p> <p><i>The DDM stated that HR Capacity Development Plan has already been formulated.</i></p>	<p>N/A</p>

	<i>project also had a component of capacity building. The DDM should review, assess and rationalize the human resource capacity building in disaster management in the country.</i>		<i>However, the same has not been verified as it has not been submitted.</i>	
11	<p>POSSIBILITIES OF INSURING IMPORTANT GOVERNMENT ASSETS SHOULD BE EXPLORED</p> <p><i>Currently, there is no system in place to insure critical public assets and infrastructures covering against losses arising from major disasters. Therefore, the DDM in consultation with relevant agencies should explore possibilities of insuring critical public infrastructures so that the government does not have to bear the entire cost of reconstruction</i></p>	<i>DDM mentioned that this is a good recommendation but it is beyond the Department’s prerogative since it requires the Government and indeed the Parliament’s decision.</i>	<p><u>Not Implemented:</u></p> <p><i>No action has been intimated to RAA. The DDM being the nodal agency should initiate for further course of actions.</i></p>	<i>The Department considers itself not an appropriate agency for the implementation of the recommendation.</i>
