



ભૂતાન રાજ્ય પરીક્ષણ કોર્પુસ

**ROYAL AUDIT AUTHORITY**

*Bhutan Integrity House*

Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources



Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources

# REVIEW REPORT OF PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORTS

**May 2021**

*"Every individual must strive to be principled. And individuals in positions of responsibility must even strive harder".*

- His Majesty the King Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck



ଶ୍ରୀ ସାହୁଦ କେନ୍ଦ୍ର ବିଷୟ ମନ୍ତ୍ରୀଙ୍କା  
ROYAL AUDIT AUTHORITY

Bhutan Integrity House

Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources



RAA/(AG-SP)/03/2021/044

Date: 18 May 2021

The Hon'ble Speaker  
National Assembly of Bhutan  
Thimphu

**Subject: Submission of Review Report of Five Performance Audit Reports**

Your Excellency,

In accordance with Section 42(b)(2) of the Rules of Procedures of Public Accounts Committee, the Royal Audit Authority (RAA) has the honour to submit the review report of the following two Performance Audit Reports:

1. Review of Judiciary System and Practices
2. Performance Audit Report on Housing Development-Adequacy and Affordability
3. Performance Audit Report on Food self-sufficiency & Security
4. Performance Audit Report on Road Maintenance Works, and
5. Performance audit on Urban Planning and Development in Thimphu throm

Based on Action Taken Reports received from the concerned agencies, the RAA has conducted the desk review followed by field visits, wherever required.

The statuses of the reports as of 30<sup>th</sup> April 2021 are detailed in Exhibits enclosed herewith for kind perusal.

Thanking you and looking forward to Your Excellency's continued support.

Yours respectfully,

(Tashi)  
**Auditor General of Bhutan**

Copy to:

1. The Hon'ble Prime Minister, Royal Government of Bhutan for kind information
2. The Hon'ble Chief Justice, Supreme Court of Bhutan, *in respect of* review report of review of Judiciary System and Practices
3. The Hon'ble Chairperson, National Council of Bhutan for kind information

*"Every individual must strive to be principled. And individuals in positions of responsibility must even strive harder."*  
*- His Majesty the King Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck*



ROYAL AUDIT AUTHORITY  
*Bhutan Integrity House*

Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources



4. The Hon'ble Opposition Leader, National Assembly of Bhutan for kind information
5. The Hon'ble Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee, 3<sup>rd</sup> Parliament of Bhutan (6 Copies)
6. The Secretary, MoWHS, Thimphu, *in respect of review report of* Performance Audit Report on Housing Development-Adequacy and Affordability, Road Maintenance Works and Urban Planning and Development in Thimphu Throm
7. The Secretary, MoAF, *in respect of review report of* Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency and Security
8. The Secretary, NLCS, *in respect of review report of* Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency and Security and Housing Development-Adequacy and Affordability
9. The Thrompon, Thimphu Thromde, *in respect of review report of* Performance audit on Urban Planning and Development in Thimphu Throm
10. Chief Executive Officer, NHDCL, *in respect of review report of* Performance Audit Report Housing Development-Adequacy and Affordability
11. Chief Executive Officer, NPPF, *in respect of review report of* Performance Audit Report Housing Development-Adequacy and Affordability
12. Assistant Auditor General, Performance Audit Division & Thematic Audit Division, RAA
13. Office copy.

## **Abstract of Review Reports**

---

### **Review of Judiciary System and Practices**

---

Review of Judiciary System and Practices was conducted to ascertain the operational efficiency and effectiveness of the Judiciary in delivery of fair, just, and equitable justices on time for the period covering from 2012-13 to 2016-17. The final report was issued on 02 July 2019.

The report contained 37 observations under three broad categories and 17 recommendations which are aimed at supporting the judiciary in its efforts and initiatives of its system and processes in achieving its goals of rendering timely delivery of fair, just, and equitable justices.

After 2<sup>nd</sup> review of Action Taken Report (ATR) submitted by the Judiciary, two recommendations are considered implemented, nine partially implemented and six recommendations not implemented.

The statuses of the recommendations are attached as **Exhibit – A**.

### **Performance Audit Report on Housing Development-Adequacy and Affordability**

---

Performance Audit Report on Housing Development-Adequacy and Affordability was conducted with the overall objective of the audit was to ascertain the effectiveness of national housing development activity including home ownership programmes in providing adequate, affordable and livable housing in urban centers for the period covering from 01 January 2013 to 31 December 2017. The final report was issued on 20 March 2019.

The report contained 26 observations under nine broad categories and 15 recommendations which are aimed at addressing the issues of housing development.

After 2<sup>nd</sup> review of ATR submitted by the MoWHS, NHDCL and NLCS, seven recommendations are considered implemented, four partially implemented and four recommendations not implemented.

The statuses of the recommendations are attached as **Exhibit – B**.

### **Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency and Security**

---

The Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency and Security was conducted with the overall objective to ascertain the efficiency and effectiveness of Ministry of Agriculture and Forests (MoAF) in enhancing food self-sufficiency and security by making various kinds of food available through improved production, and access to food for the period covering from 2012-13 to 2016-17. The final report was issued on 11 February 2019. The report contained 18 observations and 14

recommendations which are intended to address the shortcomings and deficiencies thereby enhancing efficiency and effectiveness of the Ministry in enhancing food security.

After 3<sup>rd</sup> review of ATR submitted by the MoAF and NLCS, five recommendations are considered implemented, eight partially implemented and one recommendation not implemented.

The statuses of the recommendations are attached as **Exhibit-C**.

### **Performance Audit Report on Road Maintenance Works**

---

Performance Audit Report on Road Maintenance Works was conducted with the overall objective of the audit was to ascertain the economy, efficiency and effectiveness of Department of Roads (DoR) in the operation and management of road maintenance works for the period covering from 2013-14 to 2017-18. The final report was issued on 25 October 2019.

The report contained 23 observations under three broad categories and eight recommendations which aimed at enhancing efficiency and effectiveness in road maintenance works.

After 2<sup>nd</sup> review of ATR submitted by the Ministry of Works and Human Settlement (MoWHS), two recommendations are considered implemented, five partially implemented and one recommendation not implemented.

The statuses of the recommendations are attached as **Exhibit – D**.

### **Performance audit on Urban Planning and Development in Thimphu Throm**

---

Performance Audit Report on Bhutan Chamber of Commerce and Industry was conducted with the objectives to ascertain whether there exists appropriate institutional framework for effective and efficient urban planning and development and whether urban planning and development initiatives are in compliance to standards and norms for the period covering 2013-14 to 31.12.2017-18. The final report was issued on 27 December 2019.

The report contained 18 observations under two broad categories and 11 recommendations in order to mitigate the challenges faced and enhance efficiency and effectiveness in urban planning and development in Thimphu Throm, and to objectively guide and ensure proper and timely implementation of other plans in the pipeline for the country.

After 2<sup>nd</sup> review of ATR submitted by the MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde, eight recommendations are considered partially implemented and three not implemented.

The statuses of the recommendations are attached as **Exhibit – E**.

\*\*\*\*\*

# **EXHIBIT-A**

**Review Report on Review of  
Judiciary System and  
Practices**

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
3.1	Judiciary should review and implement those provisions of the Judicial Service Act not yet implemented	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA appreciates Judiciary for coming up with the draft Rules of Judiciary 2020 on human resource development, ethics and integrity, appointment and promotion, recruitment of human resource and transfer of service.</p> <p>However, since the draft rules are yet to be endorsed by the Judicial Service Council, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for full implementation of the recommendation.</p>	The Judiciary acknowledges that the recommendations were partially implemented during the first review. The Status is however no different now. With rules and regulations on human resource development, ethics and integrity, appointment and promotion, recruitment of human resource and transfer of service drafted, the Judiciary was to take this forward, as stated in the first review, to the Judicial Service Council for endorsement. But the Judicial Service Council has mandated that the rules and regulations be deliberated in the Judicial Conference before it is endorsed. As it is Judges and Judicial Personnel who would be affected by the	To be implemented by the time when movement restrictions and quarantine measures are lifted by the Government .	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until the draft Rules of Judiciary 2020 and Judiciary Strategic Plan 2020-2030 are endorsed and finalized.</p>

***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			rules and regulations, the Judiciary as per the direction of the Council attempted to organize the conference. However, given the current situation of world-wide pandemic where movements and gatherings are restricted, we couldn't forgo the national mandate. Therefore, the Conference couldn't be conducted and for that the rules and regulations stand as it is in its draft form. Even now we are not able to conduct the conference because we have judges who are in the southern zones who have to undergo quarantine should call them for the conference. Just for attending a 2-3 days meeting, we are losing weeks of Judicial		

***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			<p>Personnel's attendance in their respective Courts which in turn hinders access to justice for our people. Therefore, we are waiting for the relaxation of movement restrictions in the country to conduct the conference.</p> <p>On the recruitment of graduate with a year of national legal course into the pool of Bench Clerks, the Judiciary has already considered this upgradation with an aim to enhance the competency of judicial personnel thereby improving the quality of our works. The Judicial Service Council during its 23<sup>rd</sup> meeting has endorsed this idea in principal and the Judiciary is currently</p>		

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			working this out with the relevant stakeholders through consultation under the developmental of Judiciary Strategic Plan which began sometimes in January 2021. With the Strategic Plan in place, we will have a way forward on the recruitment of Bench Clerks and other human resource developments. The Strategic Plan is expected to be finalized by December 2021 and we are on prospective road ahead.		
3.2	Judiciary should consider appointing Drangpon Rabjams from persons having served as an Advocate	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  Since the recommendation is being pursued by the Judiciary and OAG, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.	As stated in 3.1, the Judiciary is developing our Strategic Plan 2020-2030. In the strategic plan, the matter considering the appointment of Drangpon Rabjams from persons having served as an	To be implemented when the Judiciary Strategic Plan is endorsed in	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  RAA appreciate the efforts initiated in developing the Strategic Plan 2020-2030 where Judiciary would be taking into consideration the appointment of Drangpon Rabjams

## Exhibit-A

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
		Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for full implementation of the recommendation.	<p>advocate will definitely be explored. The Strategic Planning team along with the consultant has already begun consultation with OAG, Bar Council, RCSC and other relevant stakeholders for this and other imperative matters.</p> <p>Therefore, this activity will be implemented when the strategic plan is finalized by December 2021 based on its outcome and recommendations.</p>	December 2021 as per its recommendations.	<p>from persons having served as an advocate and assured to implement the same based on its outcome and recommendations.</p> <p>However, until the strategic plan is finalized and implemented, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>
3.3	Government should establish proper legal framework for instituting Notary Public Offices in the country	<b>Not Implemented</b>  While it has been noted that the responsibility of establishing a legal framework for instituting Notary Public Offices in the country does not lie with the Judiciary, the onus	The Judiciary has clarified in our first review that the responsibility of establishing a legal framework for instituting Notary Public Office in the country does not lie with us.	Propose as per the recommendations of the Judiciary Strategic Plan which will be	<b>Not Implemented</b>  The status of the recommendation shall remain the same since the Judiciary is yet to propose the establishment of proper legal framework for instituting Notary

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>of apprising and proposing the need to the Government is with the Judiciary.</p> <p>As such, the Judiciary may consider proposing the need to the Government for appropriate action.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>	However, in the interest of enhancing access to justice for our people, the Judiciary shall, as recommended by the RAA, consider proposing to the government on the same matter as per the recommendations of our Strategic Plan which will be finalized by December 2021.	finalized in December 2021.	<p>Public Offices in the country to the government.</p> <p>It has been reported that the Judiciary would consider proposing to the government as per the recommendations of the Judiciary Strategic Plan which will be finalized in December 2021.</p>
3.4	Declaration of Conflict of Interest should be made mandatory	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>RAA appreciates Judiciary for coming up with the draft guideline on Conflict of Interest. However, since the</p>	As stated in section 3.1 of this document, the Judiciary is awaiting the conduct of Judicial Conference during which the rule shall be deliberated among Judicial	To be implemented by the time when movement restrictions	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until the draft guideline on Conflict of Interest is endorsed and accordingly implemented.</p>

## Exhibit-A

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
		<p>draft guideline is yet to be endorsed during the Judiciary Conference, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for full implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p>personnel and subsequently endorsed by the Judicial Service Council. The justifications for not being able to conduct the Judicial Conference is same as in 3.1.</p>	<p>and quarantine measures are lifted by the Government .</p>	
3.6	Royal Judicial Service Council should implement Section 32 of the Judicial Service Act 2007	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The response has been noted, however, Judiciary should provide documents related to Law Review Task Force and guidelines developed, if any for RAA's further review.</p> <p>Further, Judiciary may also comment on whether the establishment of Law Review</p>	<p>The Judiciary acknowledges that the Judiciary Service Council, in line with section 32 of the Judicial Service Act 2007, has the legal duty to review laws from time to time and submit to Parliament to ensure that they are keeping with the changing situation and propose amendments and modifications as and when necessary. The Judiciary on our part has long before</p>	<p>To be implemented once the Judiciary Strategic Plan is finalized in December 2021.</p>	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The Judiciary accepted the fact that the Judiciary Service Council although established long before has not been able to implement Section 32 of the Judicial Service Act 2007 due to ambiguity in mandates.</p> <p>However, it has been assured that a proper system will be instituted with the development of SOPs or guidelines as per the</p>

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>Task Force is in line with the Judicial Act 2007.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p>established the Judicial Service Council but the mandates seem to have not been clearly shouldered. In this regard, the Judiciary has already embarked on strengthening the functioning of Service Council through development of Judiciary Strategic Plan. We assure that a proper system will be instituted with development of SOPs or guidelines, if required, through the recommendation of the strategic plan which will be finalized by December 2021.</p>		<p>recommendation of the strategic plan which will be finalized in December 2021.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>
3.7	Judiciary should consider establishing a National Standard for Court proceedings	<b>Not Implemented</b> <p>While the due process to be followed in the issuance of summon orders is prescribed, there are no maximum limits</p>	As recommended by the RAA, the Judiciary will come up with the standardized and comprehensive time and service delivery standards in the future as per the findings	To be implemented once the Judiciary Strategic Plan is	<b>Not Implemented</b> <p>It has been reported that the Judiciary is in the process of developing the strategic plan 2020-2030 and assured to come up with</p>

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>on the numbers of summon orders to be issued. Further, the time gaps to be maintained between two summon orders is not specified.</p> <p>Therefore, RAA reiterates the Judiciary in coming up with the standardised and comprehensive time and service delivery standards.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p>of the Judiciary Strategic Plan when it is finalized in December 2021. One solid component of the strategic plan will be the service delivery gaps and opportunities and we are assured that the document will provide us a vivid view on the overall service delivery operations and standards that are required for efficient functioning. Taking clue from this review report, the strategic plan developer has already considered reviewing the standard time requirements for adjudication, various stages of court proceedings, issuance of summon orders, number of rebuttals that can be admitted by the Court and maximum</p>	finalized in December 2021.	<p>the standardized and comprehensive time and service delivery standards as per the recommendations of the Judiciary Strategic Plan.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

## Exhibit-A

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
			<p>number of summon orders that a Court can issue.</p> <p>Therefore, the works have already been initiated and the gaps will soon be addressed.</p>		
3.8	<p>Appeal System should be rationalized to render it more efficient</p> <p>It has been noted that an appellate court can accept appeals where lower Court had made an egregious error with respect to some factual issues. However, the petitions accepted in general were neither of law nor of factual errors as observed by the audit. The appeal petitions were mostly generic.</p> <p>RAA is not stressing on the numbers of petitions, rather emphasizing on the acceptance</p>	<b>Not Implemented</b> <p>Appeal, as reported in our first review, is a matter of right and Courts cannot limit it until provisions in the law are amended. But it can be controlled by the Judiciary by screening the appeal petitions and registering those cases that merits review.</p> <p>The Judiciary has been doing this. The main purpose of Judges in the appellate courts conducting miscellaneous hearing, before a case is registered, is to screen out those that does not merit</p>	<p>To be implemented once the Judiciary Strategic Plan is finalized in December 2021.</p>	<b>Not Implemented</b> <p>Although appeal is vital in redressing the grievances of aggrieved party besides the matter of right as mentioned, the accepting of appeals without limiting to issue of law and egregious errors by lower courts may impede in delivery of timely justice.</p> <p>As apparent from the Appeal case statistics for the period 2012-2016, table-5 of the audit report, the Supreme Court had applied appellate process while considering the appeal cases whereas other appellate courts had accepted all appeal cases</p>	

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>of all appeal cases by appellate courts without limiting the appellate process to issues of law and egregious errors by the lower courts.</p> <p>Therefore, RAA still urges Judiciary to review and streamline the appeal processes for greater compliance.</p> <p>Further, Judiciary should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p>reviewing. As such the Judiciary does not accept generic petitions that carries no water. The Judges consciously follow the CCPC and weigh which petitions needs to be accepted.</p> <p>Therefore, there is no blind acceptance as the Judiciary is also aware that adjudication of frivolous cases provides respite to the defaulter, consumes court resources and causes undue delay in the delivery of justice.</p> <p>Since CCPC is there as the mother document for all court proceedings, the Judiciary can, at the least, consider developing a written guideline or SOP for admitting or</p>		<p>without limiting the appellate process.</p> <p>Therefore, there is a need to review and streamline the appeal process in order to avoid frivolous cases and undue delays in delivery of justice.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall be remain status quo.</p>

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			dismissing appeal petitions. We are certain that our strategic plan would spell this out clearly if need be. Therefore, we assure that this will be taken up once the strategic plan is finalized.		
3.9	Case Hearings Calendar in the Courts should be implemented	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation is considered partially implemented since the case hearing calendars are being implemented offline and very soon going be online.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for full implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p>The hearing calendar, as reported in the first review is existent but operated in offline. The Judiciary is currently incorporating it into the Case Management System and making it online. It is expected to take a few months before it is up in running.</p> <p>Once it is completed, both the judicial personnel as well as the litigants can access it as and when required. We expect it to be completed by June 2021.</p>	June 2021	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until the case hearing calendar is implemented online.</p>

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
3.11	Proper System for Enforcement of Judgments should be instituted	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>It has been noted that the mandate to enforce judgement did not lie with the Judiciary, however, the onus of proposing to the Parliament for a separate institution is with the Judiciary.</p> <p>While doing so, the Judiciary may take into consideration the cross border judgement enforcement and reporting on the status of judgment enforcement after the deadline.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for</p>	<p>As reported in the first review, it is not the Judiciary's mandate to enforce judgements. However, the Judiciary considering the need of the hour has directed ourselves to take up the enforcement too. We know that justice is not delivered until the judgement is enforced.</p> <p>Therefore, the Judiciary has instructed every Court Registrar of the Dzongkhag and Dungkhag Courts to enforce the judgement and provide justice to our people. This has been implemented to fill the vacuum created by the absence of a full-fledged Enforcement Department/</p>	<p>To be implemented once the Judiciary Strategic Plan is finalized in December 2021.</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>It has been reported that the Judiciary has instructed every Court Registrar of the Dzongkhag and Dungkhag Courts to enforce the judgement and provide justice to the people. Furthermore, a separate unit called Endorsement Unit has been established in High Court to enforce the judgements.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the Judiciary will be proposing for a separate institution for judgement enforcement to the government and the same would be incorporated in the Judiciary Strategic Plan.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation shall be considered partially implemented.</p>

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		implementation of the recommendation.	<p>Division instituted by the Government.</p> <p>For the High Court, a separate unit called Endorsement Unit has been established with an objective to enforce judgements rendered by the High Court. Moving forward, the Judiciary will, as recommended by the RAA, propose for a separate institution for enforcement to the Government. The Judiciary will also take into consideration the cross-border judgement enforcement and reporting.</p> <p>We assure that these will be reviewed and incorporated in our Judiciary Strategic Plan through which we can apprise</p>		However, the full implementation of the recommendation shall be reviewed after finalization of the Judiciary Strategic Plan.

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			the Royal Government for consideration and necessary action.		
3.12	Possibility of capturing Information of other stakeholders in the CMS should be considered.	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>Since the development of system is under process, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for full implementation of the recommendation.</p>	Under the Justice Sector Coordination, we have a data integration program where we have already explored for capturing and sharing of information from our Case Management System (CMS) to other stakeholders and vice-versa. The GNHC and the OAG are leading the process. As of date, they have hired the consultant to develop the interface system. Delayed a bit due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the two offices are on rush to complete the works within the project period which is before June 2023.	June 2023	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>While the response has been noted, the implementation of the recommendation shall be reviewed only after the full completion of the CMS.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

**Exhibit-A**

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			Once these data are integrated, all justice sectors will be able to share and view data when required. Therefore, this is being implemented at a national level particularly in support to achieve the 16 <sup>th</sup> NKRA-Justice services and institutions strengthened.		
3.13	Judiciary should ensure accurate and comprehensive Case Information	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  RAA appreciates Judiciary for coming up with the draft rules and regulations for e-litigation.  However, the implementation of the rules and regulation will be reviewed after finalization of the same.  In view of the above initiative, the recommendation is	The Judiciary had up-graded the PHP and database version of CMS from version 5 to 7.4 which is compatible with current existing systems elsewhere.  The system is now stable and we assure that data generation henceforth can be accurate. We have also migrated the storage to government data center and this ensures data is safe and protected.	Upgraded in January 2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  While the response has been noted, the implementation of the Case Management System (CMS) would be verified at a later date.  Until such time, the recommendation shall remain partially implemented.

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>considered partially implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for full implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p>In addition to this, several fields in the drop down have been added to capture wide aspect of case data ranging from petty civil cases to crime. Therefore, we have fully adopted the system and our officials are using in full swing. This is a fully implemented activity.</p>		
3.14	Accessibility of Judgments to Public should be enhanced	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>Since an e-Archive system has been developed and ready to be launched, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for full implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p>The e-Archive system has been developed and is ready to be launched. Once it is launched, the Judiciary will start scanning judgements rendered by Courts and upload into the e-archive system.</p> <p>It is expected to operate in full swing by June 2021.</p>	June 2021	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>Until the launch of e-Archive system and accordingly implemented, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

## Exhibit-A

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
3.15	<p>Procedures for availing legal aid services should be prescribed</p> <p>Although it may be the responsibility of the State to provide legal aid to secure justice, the Judiciary being an institution carrying out legal activities should apprise and propose to the Parliament for a need to designate a Public legal office to provide legal aid services to an indigent person for both civil and criminal suits.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The Judiciary has been ardent proponent of legal aid ever since it surfaced some decades ago. We wanted it to be formalized and implemented so that it could benefit indigent person undergoing difficulty in accessing justice. In this effort, the Judiciary even went to the extent of seeking budget from RGoB following which we received Nu.0.1 M every year.</p> <p>However, the Judiciary was not able to provide this amount to any of the indigent person needing legal aid because it had no standard procedure or criterial defining the indigent person. The</p>	<p>June 2023</p>	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>While RAA appreciates Judiciary for the concerted efforts being taken towards the legal aid services, the same could not be provided in the absence of prescribed procedures.</p> <p>It has been reported that the Bar Council in collaboration with the OAG will be developing the required documents. Further, the matter will be taken up during consultation and development of our strategic plan.</p> <p>However, RAA reiterates that there is a need to designate a Public legal office to provide legal aid services to an indigent person for both civil and criminal suits.</p> <p>Until such procedures for availing legal aid services are prescribed and</p>	

***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			<p>situation is same now with no such documents in place.</p> <p>Of late, the justice sector has once again spelt the need of it. It has been tentatively agreed that the Bar Council in collaboration with the OAG will lead the process of developing required documents. The Judiciary is hopeful that we will see light at the end of the tunnel. We have been proposing in the future too for the larger interest of our people who hails from poor economic background. It's only the Judges and Court officials who understands the real conditions of indigent people who really need legal aid while appearing in Courts.</p>		implemented, the recommendation shall remain status quo.

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			<p>But without a proper guideline or SOP, the Judicial personnel have not been able to assist anyone till date.</p> <p>We will also take up the matter during consultation and development of our strategic plan. We hope the legal aid comes out as required.</p>		
3.16	Judiciary should institute a system to monitor, evaluate and report the inconsistencies in Judgments	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>While the response has been noted, RAA still feel the need for a proper system of monitoring, evaluating and reporting the inconsistencies in judgements between different levels of Courts.</p>	<p>The Judiciary feels that the appeal system which is inbuilt in the procedure of a case is in per se a monitoring and evaluation tool accepted by the judiciaries of the world. Appeal system is a time-tested and internationally validated mechanism that has been adopted in every country. As each Judge is independent from the other in terms of</p>	<p>To be implemented once the Judiciary Strategic Plan is finalized in December 2021 based on its recommend</p>	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The response has been noted. However, the Judiciary may explore and consider instituting a system during the development of the strategic plan.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p>

***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>Until such system is instituted, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Judiciary should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p>rendering decisions on a case, monitoring judgements by any other person is not right except to route through the proper procedure of appeal for reviewed of cases by the higher courts. If judgements are to be monitored, the unbiased decision of the case may be hampered.</p> <p>The Judiciary for one time tried to monitor and evaluate the lower courts. Four Justices of the Supreme Court were assigned five Districts to monitor and evaluate Judges and their performances in case proceedings and report inconsistencies, if any, to the Hon. Chief Justice of Bhutan.</p>	<p>ations, if any.</p>	

***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			<p>But during the implementation, the Judiciary observed that there was development of an undue allegiance among Justices and Judges of the District Courts being monitored. It was also learnt that the system heightened nepotism and favoritism that brought negative impacts to the otherwise cordial legal fraternity. Therefore, the Judiciary had to withdraw evaluation. It was literally encroaching the independence of the Judges in term of making decisions over cases.</p> <p>The Judiciary thereafter, rolled back to the existing system of appeal, that compromises of four tiers of</p>		

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			Courts and beyond, if need be, for systematic monitoring, evaluation and reviewing of decisions of lower courts. Appeal system therefore is the best system to monitor, evaluate and report inconsistencies in judgements between different levels of courts. However, if there are any other mechanisms that the Judiciary can adopt, we will explore during the development of the strategic plan through discussions and consultations.		
3.17	Judiciary may consider possibilities of conducting periodic peer review of its system and practices	<b>Partially Implemented</b> A peer review of its systems and practices is being conducted on a periodic basis, as reported by the Judiciary.	The Judiciary, as reported in our first review, has been conducting periodic peer review from time to time as deemed necessary.		<b>Partially Implemented</b> It has been reported that the Judiciary has been conducting periodic peer review from time to time as deemed necessary and have plans to conduct the same in future.

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>In view of the above, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p> <p>However, full implementation of the recommendation will be considered upon review of the Peer Review Report by the RAA.</p>	<p>For instance, the Judiciary initiated integrity scan in cooperation with the BNLI and Anti-Corruption Commission (ACC) to measure and promote integrity of judicial personnel.</p> <p>As noted by the RAA, a survey on access to Justices in Bhutan was also carried out by the Institute of Management Studies in 2012. Similarly, the Bhutan Transparency Initiative (BTI) also published a report on transparency and accountability.</p> <p>In the near future, we are also planning to conduct survey to measure the satisfaction level of justice services under the</p>		<p>However, the Judiciary may consider incorporating the periodic peer review plans and milestone in the strategic plan.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

## ***Exhibit-A***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Review of Judiciary System and Practices (AIN: 16001)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 02 July 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Royal Courts of Justice
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			justice sector. As such, the Judiciary has been carrying out peer review as and when deemed necessary. It is through this that we come to know our strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats (SWOT).		

\*\*\*\*\*

# **EXHIBIT-B**

**Review Report of Performance  
Audit Report on Housing  
Development- Adequacy and  
Affordability**

## ***Exhibit-B***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Housing Development- Adequacy and Affordability (AIN: 15831)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 20 March 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: MoWHS, NLCS, NHDCL, NPPF, Thimphu Thromde, Phuntsholing Thromde, Phuntsholing Dungkhag				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
1.1	Enactment of housing development Act	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>Since the drafting of the National Housing Bill is yet to be started, the recommendation is considered not implemented.</p>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>Drafting of Housing Bill was initiated in November 2020. The Act is proposed to subsume tenancy act and will incorporate all housing related developments. Once the drafting is completed, it will be submitted to the government for further directives.</p>	Completion date, June 2021	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation is considered partially implemented since the drafting of Housing Bill has been initiated since November 2020.</p> <p>The timeline provided for completion of the recommendation is June 2021.</p>
1.4	Need to develop livability index	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>It was found that there are many informal settlements in and around Thimphu and Phuntsholing Thromdes. The households in this category have shelters of substandard quality, unsafe and unhygienic neighborhood environment.</p> <p>Although the thromdes are aware of the situations, there</p>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>During the bilateral meeting with the RAA and MoWHS, it was agreed to drop the formulation of the livability index. However, the Ministry has proposed to develop urban governance index in place of livability index in the next fiscal year. This is subject to approval of the budget by the Government.</p>	No timeline provided	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>While taking note of the response, the RAA emphasized on the informal settlements in and around Thimphu and Phunstholing thromdes where living conditions are compromised in terms of basic amenities such as water supply, sanitation, living space and safety of structures.</p>

## ***Exhibit-B***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Housing Development- Adequacy and Affordability (AIN: 15831)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 20 March 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: MoWHS, NLCS, NHDCL, NPPF, Thimphu Thromde, Phuntsholing Thromde, Phuntsholing Dungkhag				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>existed no strategies to improve the situation.</p> <p>Thimphu Thromde responded of having plans to build a low income housing to ease out informal settlements and stated the importance of having a detailed study for doing away with the informal settlements.</p> <p>As such, MoWHS in collaboration with the relevant stakeholders may consider developing a strategy to control the informal settlements.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p>			<p>Therefore, in order to improve the living conditions of the informal settlements or eliminate the same in a phased manner, the authorities concerned are recommended to collaborate and develop strategies.</p> <p>However, it has been reported that the MoWHS has proposed to develop urban governance index in the next fiscal year, 2021-2022.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the MoWHS should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>

## ***Exhibit-B***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Housing Development- Adequacy and Affordability (AIN: 15831)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 20 March 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: MoWHS, NLCS, NHDCL, NPPF, Thimphu Thromde, Phuntsholing Thromde, Phuntsholing Dungkhag				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		Further, the MoWHS should provide a timeline for development of strategy to control the informal settlements.			
1.5	Need to establish central regulating and coordinating agency for housing development	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>MoWHS is yet to establish a dedicated Division/Department to oversee and address housing related issues in the country as per the National Housing Policy 2020.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, MoWHS should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>In view of the human resource constraints, the Ministry is not able to establish a dedicated agency for housing development. Until such time that a formal agency be established, the housing mandates will be looked after by the Department of Human Settlement. Establishment of housing unit within the Department will be pursued with the Ministry soon.</p>	<p>No timeline provided</p>	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>Though no dedicated division/department was established to oversee and address housing relate issues, yet, it is expected that there could be opportunity to address the related issues through the enactment of the Housing Bill. As such, the RAA request the MoWHS to review the possibility of addressing the issues in the Housing Bill.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the MoWHS should provide a timeline to submit an assessment report stipulating that whether the implementation of the</p>

## ***Exhibit-B***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Housing Development- Adequacy and Affordability (AIN: 15831)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 20 March 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: MoWHS, NLCS, NHDCL, NPPF, Thimphu Thromde, Phuntsholing Thromde, Phuntsholing Dungkhag				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
					recommendation would or would not be taken care of by the Housing Act.
1.6	Necessity for housing needs assessment and clear road map for housing development	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>It has been reported that both the institutions, MoWHS and NHDCL have either carried out the housing needs assessment or survey for the affordable housing.</p> <p>However, RAA recommends the requirement of needs assessment at the National level in collaboration with the relevant stakeholders and to come up with a clear road map along with the funding arrangements.</p> <p>In order to address the issue, the establishment of a dedicated housing</p>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>The Department carried out the housing needs assessment for the 4 Thromdes in June, 2020. The assessment for the 20 Dzongkhag Thromdes and 20 Dzongkhag Yenlag Thromdes will be completed by June, 2021. Further, the Ministry is finalizing on the housing strategy encompassing housing issues and challenges. The strategy will be finalized by June, 2021.</p> <p><b>NHDCL</b></p> <p>The housing need assessment has been done by MoWHS in four thromdes. Housing need assessment for 20 dzongkhags are</p>	August 2019 to June 2022  January 2021 to July 2024	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA noted that MoWHS had carried out housing needs assessment for four thromdes and the same will be completed for 20 dzongkhags in June 2021. The MoWHS is also coming up with the housing strategy which will be finalized in June 2021.</p> <p>Further, NHDCL will be coming up with a clear road map along with the funding arrangements after the housing needs assessment is completed by the MoWHS.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

## ***Exhibit-B***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Housing Development- Adequacy and Affordability (AIN: 15831)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 20 March 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: MoWHS, NLCS, NHDCL, NPPF, Thimphu Thromde, Phuntsholing Thromde, Phuntsholing Dungkhag				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		development and regulatory agency is of paramount importance.	under process and will be completed in the end of June 2021. Then the NHDCL will come up with the clear road map along with the funding arrangements. A housing unit will be established under the Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS.		
2.2	Need to promote conduciveness for ownership of condominiums	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>It has been reported that the condominiums and related issues will be addressed in the Housing Act.</p> <p>However, until the National Housing Act comes in force, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, MoWHS should provide a timeline for</p>	No further response	No timeline provided	<p><b>Not implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until the National Housing Act is enacted and comes in force.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the MoWHS should provide a timeline to submit an assessment report stipulating that whether the implementation of the recommendation would or would not be taken care of by the Housing Act.</p>

## ***Exhibit-B***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Housing Development- Adequacy and Affordability (AIN: 15831)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 20 March 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: MoWHS, NLCS, NHDCL, NPPF, Thimphu Thromde, Phuntsholing Thromde, Phuntsholing Dungkhag				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		implementation of the recommendation.			
4.1	Releasing state land for housing development on long-term lease	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>While RAA recommended only to explore the possibility of releasing land on long-term lease for housing development in urban areas, NLCS responded that the recommendation is not implementable.</p> <p>As such, NLCS should provide justification or reasons behind not implementable of the recommendation for RAA's reference and record.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p>	<p><b>NLCS</b></p> <p>No further response</p>	<p>No timeline provided</p>	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until the National Housing Act is enacted and comes in force.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the MoWHS in collaboration with NLCS should provide a timeline to submit an assessment report stipulating that whether the implementation of the recommendation would or would not be taken care of by the Housing Act.</p>

## ***Exhibit-B***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Housing Development- Adequacy and Affordability (AIN: 15831)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 20 March 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: MoWHS, NLCS, NHDCL, NPPF, Thimphu Thromde, Phuntsholing Thromde, Phuntsholing Dungkhag				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
4.3	Need to come up with real estates in the outskirts of Thimphu Thromde	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>While RAA commends NHDCL for the initiatives, it requires the coordinated efforts of the other relevant agencies as well.</p> <p>There are many agencies contribution to housing development in Bhutan but working in silos with different mandates.</p> <p>Therefore, in order to address the issue, the establishment of a dedicated housing development and regulatory agency is of paramount importance.</p> <p>In view of NHDCL's initiative, the recommendation is</p>	<p><b>NHDCL</b></p> <p>The Department of Human Settlement under MoWHS will be initiating the housing development and regulatory agency and the department is working on it.</p>	July 2021 to July 2023	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until the National Housing Act is enacted and comes in force.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the MoWHS in collaboration with NLCS should provide a timeline to submit an assessment report stipulating that whether the implementation of the recommendation would or would not be taken care of by the Housing Act.</p>

## ***Exhibit-B***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Housing Development- Adequacy and Affordability (AIN: 15831)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 20 March 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: MoWHS, NLCS, NHDCL, NPPF, Thimphu Thromde, Phuntsholing Thromde, Phuntsholing Dungkhag				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		considered partially implemented.			
5.2	Need to explore the possibility of NPPF collaborating with NHDCL for funding for affordable housing development	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>It has been noted that NHDCL is exploring funds for affordable housing development through ADB and MoF.</p> <p>Further, the collaborations between NPPF and NHDCL is underway as reported by the NHDCL.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p>	<p><b>NHDCL</b></p> <p>NHDCL has made an enquiry with NPPF on the funding modality with consideration on interest rates. Considering the present interest rate, taking housing loan is not viable option. However, the discussion is still being made.</p>	<p>No timeline provided</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>NHDCL reported that the talks are going on between NHDCL and NPPF on the funding for affordable housing development.</p> <p>However, until the outcome of the collaboration meeting is shared with the RAA, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the NHDCL should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>

\*\*\*\*\*

# **EXHIBIT-C**

**Review Report of Performance  
Audit Report on Food Self-  
sufficiency and Security**

## Exhibit-C

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency & Security (AIN: 15651)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 11 February 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Ministry of Agriculture and Forest, National Land Commission Secretariat and Gross National Happiness Commission				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 3 <sup>rd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
4.1	Ministry should establish proper institutional linkages for an integrated approach to achieve food security	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA noted that the MoAF has come up with various initiatives and programs and involved other relevant stakeholders such as MoLHR, MoEA, MoF and MoFA. The tripartite MoU was found drafted between MoAF, MoEA and MoLHR. Further, the Ministry also has plans to engage with Armed forces and Nunneries.</p> <p>While RAA commends the various initiatives and programs, the implementation for the same will be reviewed upon submission of the implementation status/ reports to the RAA.</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Established RNR EDCU to coordinate and enhance developed guidelines for integrated approach to enterprise development.</li> <li>Established more than 30 food security enhancement enterprises.</li> <li>White paper on school and hospital feeding program developed and approved.</li> <li>Integrated agriculture focused marketing cooperative established.</li> </ol> <p>Integrated national team established for vegetable security.</p>	2019 to 2020	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>While RAA noted Ministry's numerous initiatives and programs, there still exist inadequacy in institutional linkages amongst relevant sectors such as Ministries, Gross National Happiness Commission (GNHC), National Land Commission Secretariat (NLCS), Bhutan Chamber of Commerce and Industries (BCCI), Farmers Cooperatives, Food Corporation of Bhutan Limited (FCBL) and other relevant agencies to take ownership in implementation of the FNS policy and other issues related to food security.</p> <p>As such, the MoAF should lead and coordinate the overall implementation of food security</p>

## ***Exhibit-C***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency & Security (AIN: 15651)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 11 February 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Ministry of Agriculture and Forest, National Land Commission Secretariat and Gross National Happiness Commission				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 3 <sup>rd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.			policy and strategic action plans while the MoH should lead and coordinate the implementation of nutrition security programs.  Therefore, MoAF until establishes proper institutional linkages among relevant agencies and the sectors involved in the planning, monitoring and evaluation for implementation of FNS Policy, the recommendation shall remain status quo.
4.2	Ministry in collaboration with NLCS should formulate a comprehensive agriculture land classification and zones	<b>Partially Implemented</b> NLCS reported that they have completed the Land Use Land Cover (LULC) for Samtse Dzongkhag (Pilot Project area) completed and initiated suitability study analysis.  Meanwhile, the completion of suitability study analysis for	<b>NLCS</b> The Land Use Land Cover (LULC) of Samtse Dzongkhag (Pilot Project area) completed and initiated suitability analysis of zones.  <b>High Resolution Image (HRI)</b> procured and field	July 2018 to June 2023	<b>Partially Implemented</b> The recommendation shall remain status quo until the zoning for entire country is completed and national zoned maps produced.

## ***Exhibit-C***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency & Security (AIN: 15651)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 11 February 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Ministry of Agriculture and Forest, National Land Commission Secretariat and Gross National Happiness Commission				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 3 <sup>rd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>Samtse Dzongkhag and LULC for four western Dzongkhags is scheduled in the current FY 2020-2021.</p> <p>However, until the zoning for entire country is completed and national zoned maps produced, the status of recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>	<p>observation for ground control points completed. LULC for 4 more western dzongkhag could not be carried out this year but rescheduled to cover whole dzongkhags in next FY. However, suitability analysis will be focused on southern belt only.</p>		
4.4	NLCS should finalize the draft National Land policy	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>Since the draft National Land Policy Framework is under review by the Royal Secretariat, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>	<p>National Land Policy Framework developed and the draft NLP is under review by the Royal Secretariat.</p>	May 2019 to December 2019	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until the National Land Policy Framework is approved.</p>
4.5	Ministry should ensure sustainable use and	<b>Partially Implemented</b>	No further response.	2019 to 2023	<b>Partially Implemented</b>

## Exhibit-C

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency & Security (AIN: 15651)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 11 February 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Ministry of Agriculture and Forest, National Land Commission Secretariat and Gross National Happiness Commission				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 3 <sup>rd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	management of agriculture land	<p>While RAA appreciates the efforts being made towards reversion and conversion of wet lands, the implementation statuses of Agriculture Land Development Guideline (ALDC) 2017 at the Dzongkhag levels should be shared with the RAA for review.</p> <p>Similarly, the review report of KPIs should also be shared with the RAA.</p> <p>Until such time, the status of the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>			<p>The recommendation shall remain status quo.</p> <p>RAA had issued letter seeking status update for the unresolved audit recommendations vide letter No.RAA/FuCD/(J45)/PA Report/MoAF/2021/450 dated 1<sup>st</sup> April 2021.</p>
4.6	The MoAF should ensure maintenance of National Food Security Reserve with FCBL	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  While RAA appreciates the efforts taken by the MoAF and	No further response.	No timeline provided	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  The recommendation shall remain status quo.

**Exhibit-C**

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency & Security (AIN: 15651)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 11 February 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Ministry of Agriculture and Forest, National Land Commission Secretariat and Gross National Happiness Commission				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 3 <sup>rd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
		<p>FCBL in stocking up of essentials during the COVID-19 pandemic, the FCBL lacked in storage capacity and fund.</p> <p>Therefore, the MoAF in collaboration with the Government and the FCBL should develop a strategy taking cognizance the NFSR on the requirement to maintain SAARC Food Security Reserve and the SAARC Food Bank in preparedness for unforeseen national emergencies and natural calamities.</p> <p>Further, a definite timeline should be provided in order to come up with a strategy.</p>			<p>RAA had issued letter seeking status update for the unresolved audit recommendations vide letter No.RAA/FuCD/(J45)/PA Report/MoAF/2021/450 dated 1<sup>st</sup> April 2021.</p>

## Exhibit-C

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency & Security (AIN: 15651)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 11 February 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Ministry of Agriculture and Forest, National Land Commission Secretariat and Gross National Happiness Commission				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 3 <sup>rd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
4.8	Ministry in collaboration with the financial institutions should come up with affordable access to credit and crop insurance schemes	<b>Partially Implemented</b> MoAF reported that the proposal has been submitted to the Cabinet and approval for the same is awaited.  Until such time, the status of the recommendation shall remain status quo.	No further response.	2019 to 2020	<b>Partially Implemented</b> The recommendation shall remain status quo in the absence of Action Taken Report (ATR).  RAA had issued letter seeking status update for the unresolved audit recommendations vide letter No.RAA/FuCD/(J45)/PA Report/MoAF/2021/450 dated 1 <sup>st</sup> April 2021.
4.9	Ministry should intervene and strengthen strategies to address Human wildlife conflict	<b>Partially Implemented</b> MoAF reported that the proposal has been submitted to the Cabinet and approval for the same is awaited.  Until such time, the status of the recommendation shall remain status quo.	No further response.	2020 to 2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b> The recommendation shall remain status quo in the absence of Action Taken Report (ATR).  RAA had issued letter seeking status update for the unresolved audit recommendations vide letter No.RAA/FuCD/(J45)/PA

## Exhibit-C

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency & Security (AIN: 15651)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 11 February 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Ministry of Agriculture and Forest, National Land Commission Secretariat and Gross National Happiness Commission				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 3 <sup>rd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
					Report/MoAF/2021/450 dated 1 <sup>st</sup> April 2021.
4.10	Ministry should develop and maintain food information management system	<p><b>Not implemented</b></p> <p>The Ministry is yet to come up with an integrated Food Information Management System for information collection, management and dissemination.</p> <p>Until such time, the status of recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>	No further response.	2020 to 2023	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo in the absence of Action Taken Report (ATR).</p> <p>RAA had issued letter seeking status update for the unresolved audit recommendations vide letter No.RAA/FuCD/(J45)/PA Report/MoAF/2021/450 dated 1<sup>st</sup> April 2021.</p>
4.14	Ministry should conduct training need analysis and impact assessment	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>Ministry is yet to carry out the activity and report the same to the RAA.</p>	<p>It is tendered out to be carried out by national consultant due to shortage of staffs under PPD.</p> <p>First round of consultant selection already done out of 6 consultants.</p>	2020 to 2023	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>Since the recommendation has been initiated, it is considered partially implemented.</p>

***Exhibit-C***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Food Self-sufficiency & Security (AIN: 15651)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 11 February 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Ministry of Agriculture and Forest, National Land Commission Secretariat and Gross National Happiness Commission				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 3 <sup>rd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		Until such time, the status of the recommendation shall remain status quo.	3 shortlisted firms have been notified and further one firm will be selected based on their intention to submit proposal (technical and financial).		However, the full implementation of the same shall be reviewed upon submission of the reports.

\*\*\*\*\*

# **EXHIBIT-D**

**Review Report of Performance  
Audit Report on the Road  
Maintenance Works**

## ***Exhibit-D***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Road Maintenance Works (AIN: 16163)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 25 October 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlement
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
4.2	The DoR should strategize to improve efficiency in restoration of monsoon damages.	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>The recommendation is considered partially implemented since the DoR, MoWHS has developed a SOP for monsoon damage and restoration works and started implementing from FY 2020-2021.</p> <p>However, the full implementation of SOP will be reviewed upon submission of the implementation report.</p>	SOP is being implemented by the regional offices with effect from 01/07/2020.	2020-2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>The response has been noted. However, the implementation of SOP by the regional offices would be verified at a later date.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>
4.4	The DoR should develop a comprehensive Information Management System	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>The recommendation is considered partially implemented since the action is being initiated and in the process.</p>	The road asset management system is developed in an excel database (offline) containing various information related to the road and its assets such as walls, drainage, earthworks etc.	2020-2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>While RAA acknowledges existence of road asset management system in excel database covering various information on road assets, the current database is not comprehensive.</p>

## ***Exhibit-D***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Road Maintenance Works (AIN: 16163)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 25 October 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlement
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			<p>The RAMS database is being updated on a yearly basis by DoR.</p> <p>Furthermore, assistance is being sought from donor agencies to make the RAMS database a web based system.</p>		<p>As such, DoR may consider incorporating the information such as year of construction, critical areas prone to landslides, year of maintenance carried out, types of maintenance carried out, year due for periodic maintenance and among others.</p> <p>Until DoR maintains a comprehensive road asset management system, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>
4.5	The DoR should develop a guideline/SOP for proper and effective coordination during emergencies	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>DoR reported that they have developed a SOP and draft is being shared with the stakeholders for comments.</p> <p>However, until the draft SOP is finalized and start</p>	<p>A meeting is scheduled in April 2021 with the stakeholders to finalize the SOP.</p>	01/12/2020-30/12/2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until DoR finalizes the SOP.</p>

## ***Exhibit-D***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Road Maintenance Works (AIN: 16163)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 25 October 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlement
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		implementing, the recommendation shall remain partially implemented.			
4.6	The DoR should strengthen the internal control for hiring of machineries /equipment	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA noted that the inadequacies in hiring of machineries/equipment were well deliberated during 4<sup>th</sup> DoR quarterly meeting held from 17 to 19 February 2020.</p> <p>The office orders to that effect were also issued to all ROs for strict compliance.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation is considered partially implemented. However, the compliance to that will be verified in the next review.</p>	<p>Conflict of interest declaration, signed log book and Tender notice for hiring is enclosed.</p>	2020 to 2022	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>While the compliances to the office orders in regard to hiring of machineries, declaration of conflict of interest and log book maintenance have been observed, the DoR is yet institute a monitoring system in quantifying the slip clearance works.</p> <p>As such, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

## Exhibit-D

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Road Maintenance Works (AIN: 16163)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 25 October 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlement				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
4.7	The DoR and ROs must ensure compliance to the prescribed standards for maintenance of roads	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>DoR is in the process of reviewing the standards and the timeline for implementation of the recommendation is from 2020-2021.</p> <p>As such, the status of the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p>	Maintenance Division, DoR is reviewing a document published by Ministry of Transportation & Highways, UK on standards for road and bridges maintenance services.	2020 to 2023	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo since DoR is still in the process of reviewing the standards of roads and bridges maintenance services.</p>
4.8	The DoR should standardize and strengthen its monitoring and supervision roles of routine maintenance works	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>DoR reported that they have prepared annual maintenance plan for the FY 2019-2020 and the plan for 2020-2021 is being prepared as well.</p> <p>The online reporting system is also being initiated, while the DoR is yet to develop a system</p>	<p>The plan for 2020-2021 FY is being implemented by the regional offices.</p> <p>ROs are using the online reporting system using google sheet for updating the status on the road maintenance plan.</p> <p>Departmental Coordination Committee has approved the</p>	2020 to 2021	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA appreciates DoR for coming out with the annual maintenance plan that is being updated through the online reporting system using google sheet.</p> <p>Further, the DoR has come up with the monitoring and inspection frequency standard where the</p>

***Exhibit-D***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Road Maintenance Works (AIN: 16163)
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 25 October 2019
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Roads, Ministry of Works and Human Settlement
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review

<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>on monitoring and inspection for routine maintenance works.</p> <p>Until such system is developed and reviewed by the RAA, the recommendation shall remain partially implemented.</p>	monitoring and inspection frequency.		<p>maintenance section would be verifying the maintenance plan once in a month and three times in a month by the sub divisional head.</p> <p>However, the frequency of monitoring and inspection would be verified at a later date.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

\*\*\*\*\*

# **EXHIBIT-E**

**Review Report of Performance  
Audit Report on Urban  
Planning and Development in  
Thimphu Throm**

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
4.1	The Government should develop a clear institutional Framework for implementation of the TSP	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA noted that the Spatial Planning Bill has been put up to the Cabinet on 11 April 2019 and it is yet to be deliberated in the Parliament.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the development of Monitoring and Evaluation Framework for planning and development of human settlements is being initiated with support from the World Bank.</p> <p>Further, the Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS in coordination with Thimphu Thromde has initiated ground surveys for the review of Thimphu Structure Plan –</p>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>Submitted the presentation for Spatial Planning Bill to PPD, MoWHS and appraised Hon'ble Zhabtog Lyonpo for deliberation during Cabinet Meeting convened on April 6<sup>th</sup>, 2021.</p> <p>Data collection from relevant agencies and preliminary findings compiled and presented to the Department on March 19, 2021 and recommendations and feedbacks are noted.</p> <p>Currently coordinating with GNHC, NSH, NEC, MoF, MoAF and MoHCA for development indicators and baseline as part of the process. The Monitoring and</p>	July 2020 to June 2021	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>The response has been noted. However, the recommendation shall remain status quo until the enactment of the Spatial Planning Bill and development of clear institutional Framework for implementation of the TSP.</p>

## Exhibit-E

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
		<p>2002-2027 as reported by the Thimphu Thromde.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p>	<p>Evaluation Framework will be completed by June, 2021 as scheduled.</p> <p><b>Thimphu thromde</b></p> <p>MoWHS in close coordination with the Thromde is reviewing the TSP 2002-2027 at this juncture and we are positive that RAA's recommendation will be addressed as and when the TSP Review is finalized.</p>		
4.2	The Government should consider adequate representation of stakeholders in Thromde decision making	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>RAA noted that the Spatial Planning Bill has been put up to the Cabinet on 11 April 2019 and it is yet to be deliberated in the Parliament.</p>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>The PPD has written to Hon'ble Cabinet Secretary vide letter no <i>MoWHS/PPD/DHS/06/238 dated August 10, 2020</i> for Government's directives.</p>	<p>Completion date, July 2020</p>	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>Until there is a clear directive from the government on the adequate representation of stakeholders in decision making for implementation of the spatial plans, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>The letter has also been written to the Hon'ble Cabinet Secretary on 10 August 2020 seeking government's directives on the adequate representation of stakeholders in Thromde decision making and the response is awaited.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p>	<b>Thimphu thromde</b> <p>Thromde has involved all relevant stakeholders in various plans and projects. However, with regard to the Thromde decision making, it is directly related to LG Act provision and central policies. Since this is a policy issue, Ministries (Zhabtog &amp; Home) will be in a better position to give status.</p>		
4.3	MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde should carry out comprehensive review of TSP and DCRs	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>It has been noted that the review of TSP and Topographical survey &amp; geotechnical study for Thimphu is being initiated.</p> <p>Similarly, the review of DCRs would also be carried out while</p>	<b>MoWHS</b> <p>The review of the Thimphu Structure Plan is a two and half year's program. It was initiated in July 2020 and as of date the following activities are completed;</p> <p>Study of TSP status (baseline data, plans and proposal</p>	July 2020 to June 2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>Since the review of TSP and DCRs is in the process, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>reviewing the TSP, as reported by Thimphu Thromde.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p>	<p>during and after implementation complete and compilation of spatial data was done prepare base map. Qualitative and quantitative survey through site visit, assessing issues, data presentation and analysis ongoing. Further, concept plans for the selected neighborhoods are scheduled to be completed by June 2021.</p> <p>The topographical survey for the Thimphu Thromde has been initiated in Many 2020. As of date, survey works for Serbithang, Babesa-Lungtenphu, Simtokha, Changbangdu, Thimphu Core, Taba, Dechencholing and Serbithang are completed.</p>		

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			<p>The remaining areas within the Thimphu Thromde will be completed within the stipulated time. In view of lack of technical capacity at the MoWHS, the DGM, MoEA has been requested to carry out the geo-technical studies vide letter no. <i>MoWHS/DHS/UPDD/Thimphu/2020-2021/488</i> dated <i>February 01, 2021</i>.</p> <p><b>Thimphu thromde</b></p> <p>The review of TSP 2002-2027 is still under process. It is to note that review of DCR will happen as a part of the TSP.</p>		
4.4	MoWHS in collaboration with Thimphu Thromde should strengthen the	<b>Partially Implemented</b> It has been reported that the signing of MoU between	<b>MoWHS</b>	July 2020 to June 2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b> The recommendation shall remain status quo until the signing of MoU

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
	coordination between themselves	<p>MoWHS &amp; Thimphu Thromde and formation of technical committee would be carried out within the timeline provided.</p> <p>Meanwhile, a comprehensive planning procedure and framework is being prepared for rural areas in June 2020 and urban areas to be completed by June 2021.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p>	<p>The drafting of the MoU will be initiated in the 3<sup>rd</sup> week of April, 2021.</p> <p>Draft framework for both urban and rural areas comprehensively has been prepared and will be presented in the Department in April 2021.</p> <p><b>Thimphu thromde</b></p> <p>The review of TSP 2002-2027 will definitely address the issue raised in the RAA Report. Although, MoU has not been drawn between the two agencies at this juncture, all issues that require guidance are referred to the Ministry for the same.</p> <p>Formation of technical</p>		between MoWHS and Thimphu thromde, development of procedures for urban development plans and formation of technical committee.

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			committee is left at the discretion of the Ministry as it involves officials from both the agencies.		
4.5	Proper record keeping and efficient monitoring should be instituted	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  The recommendation is considered partially implemented since the CDRD, DHS has started carrying out the compliance reviews for two LAPs and record keeping of plans is being initiated.	<b>MoWHS</b>  Development of CDRS app for data collection completed. Site visits to the 2 LAPs completed.  Ongoing compilation of data for analysis. The activities will be completed by June 2021.  The record keeping of settlement plans has been updated and completed. Further, the Department will develop a web based plan inventory system in the fiscal year 2021-2022 to improve and enhance the overall	Completion date, June 2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  While RAA appreciates the development of Compliance and Development Review (CDRs) app and Department's plan to develop a web based plan inventory system in the fiscal year 2021-2022, the technical supervision and monitoring of activities of Thromdes and the record keeping system for TSP and spatial plans will be reviewed on completion of web based plan inventory system.  Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
			system of maintaining records of the human settlement plans.		
4.6	MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde should carry out a resource need assessment for timely execution of development activities	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>While there was no response from MoWHS, the Thimphu Thromde reported that the Resource Need Assessment would be carried out jointly with MoWHS during the review of TSP.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p> <p>However, as per the Management Action Plan, the MoWHS, Thimphu Thromde, MoF and GNHC should carry out resource need assessment</p>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>The task has not been initiated. However, the revised Thimphu Structure Plan will be supported by implementation plans including investment plans, phasing plans and prioritization plans. This will address the current issues on identifying the resources required for implementing the provisions of the plan.</p> <p><b>Thimphu thromde</b></p> <p>This issue shall be addressed as a part of the TSP Review process and might entail</p>	July 2020 to June 2021	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>As reported by MoWHS and Thimphu thromde, the resource need assessment would be addressed by the revised Thimphu Structural Plan (TSP).</p> <p>Until the new TSP comes in force, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p>

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		for execution of development activities.	discussion with the Royal Civil Service Commission.		
4.7	Deviations should be reviewed and reported to relevant authorities for necessary action	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  The recommendation is considered partially implemented since the development of Monitoring and Evaluation Framework for planning and development of human settlements is being initiated with support from the World Bank.	<b>MoWHS</b>  Data collection from relevant agencies and preliminary findings compiled and presented to the Department on March 19, 2021 and recommendations and feedbacks are noted.  Currently coordinating with GNHC, NSH, NEC, MoF, MoAF and MoHCA for development indicators and baseline as part of the process. The Monitoring and Evaluation Framework will be completed by June, 2021 as scheduled.	July 2020 to June 2021	<b>Partially Implemented</b>  Until the DHS, MoWHS completes a comprehensive review of the deviations and develops a framework/ guideline for addressing the findings, the recommendation shall remain status quo.  Further, the MoWHS should provide CDR reports along with the thromde's Action Taken Reports.

## Exhibit-E

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
4.8	MoWHS & Thimphu Thromde in consultation with relevant agencies should come up with action plan to address transportation issues	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>While there was no response from MoWHS, the Thimphu Thromde reported that the transportation issues will be taken into consideration during the review of TSP.</p> <p>As per the Management Action Plan, the Thimphu Thromde is supposed to initiate the preparation of Transportation Master Plan in consultation with MoIC and MoWHS.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain not implemented.</p>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>No response.</p> <p><b>Thimphu thromde</b></p> <p>The transportation issue will be taken into consideration during the review of the TSP as a part of the plan.</p>	July 2020 to June 2023	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>The recommendation shall remain status quo until the completion of review of TSP 2002-2027.</p>
4.9	Housing affordability issue requires special attention	<b>Partially Implemented</b>	<p><b>MoWHS</b></p> <p>Tenancy Redressal system will be instituted along with</p>	July 2020 to June 2021	<p><b>Partially Implemented</b></p> <p>It has been reported that the DHS, MoWHS is going to institute a</p>

## Exhibit-E

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
Recom. No.	Recomm. in Brief	Status of Last Review	Action Taken	Timeline	Status of Review
		<p>implemented since the National Housing Policy 2020 has been approved, while the joint implementation of Tenancy Act by the MoWHS and Thromde is yet to be carried out.</p> <p>In case of effective monitoring and enforcement of regulations by Thimphu Thromde on the conversion of residential units to commercial spaces, the actions taken for deviation or conversion should be submitted to RAA for further review.</p>	<p>Housing Unit under the Department of Human Settlement.</p> <p>The National Housing Policy 2020 is approved.</p> <p><b>Thimphu thromde</b></p> <p>Thimphu Thromde is still compiling the data and once the action is initiated, the RAA shall be informed.</p>		<p>Tenancy Redressal System, while Thimphu thromde in the process of compiling the data on the conversion of residential units to commercial spaces and preparing the actions taken for the same.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the National Housing Policy 2020 is being approved.</p> <p>However, the recommendation shall remain status quo until the MoWHS successfully institutes a Tenancy Redressal System and thromde's submission of action taken reports.</p>
4.10	Thimphu Thromde should enhance the sewerage treatment capacity	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>While the sewer master plan is still in draft stage, it has been reported that Babesa STP will be operational by the year end</p>	<b>Thimphu thromde</b> <p>12 MLD STP at Babesa under operation since November 2020 (automation delayed due to Covid19)</p>	No timeline provided	<b>Partially Implemented</b> <p>While RAA noted the constructions and operation of the sewerage treatment plants, the Thimphu thromde is urged to expedite</p>

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		<p>2020 for the entire south Thimphu Local Area Plan.</p> <p>Further, one MLD STP is under construction at Jungzhina which will completed within a year benefiting the residents of Pamtsho, Jungshina and Babina.</p> <p>By the end of year 2021, almost 90% of buildings in the city will be provided with sewer connections and will be treated at respective STP.</p> <p>In view of the above, the recommendation is considered partially implemented.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Thimphu Thromde should provide a timeline for</p>	<p>1 MLD STP at Jungzhina is scheduled to be completed by October 2021.</p>		<p>approval of the sewerage master plan for Thimphu throm.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Thimphu Thromde should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		full implementation of the recommendation.			
4.11	Issues with Construction of MLCP 1 and MLCP 2 should be properly addressed	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>Deadline for progress/updates submission was 10 August 2020 as per the decision of PAC consultative meeting held on 05 August 2020, however RAA is yet to receive the updates/ progress regarding the Construction of MLCP 1 and MLCP 2 despite a reminder sent vide letter no. RAA/FuCD/PA Report/2020/1652 dated 09 September 2020.</p> <p>As such, the recommendation is considered not implemented.</p> <p>Further, Thimphu Thromde should provide a timeline for</p>	<p><b>Thimphu thromde</b></p> <p>Penalty for delay in the construction of MLPC was waived off by the Ministry of Finance vide letter no. MoF/FS-35/2020-2021/1887 dated 7<sup>th</sup> August 2020. However, extension of concession period was not approved. Copy of this letter is attached herewith for the reference.</p>	No timeline provided	<p><b>Not Implemented</b></p> <p>While the penalty for delays in construction of MLCP-1 &amp; 2 has been waived off by the Lhyengye Zhungshog vide letter no.C-3/66/2020/623 dated 8 July 2020 as per Ministry of Finance letter no. MoF/FS-35/2020-2021/1887 dated 7 August 2020, the decisions of Lhyengye Zhungshog for the same was not be furnished to RAA.</p> <p>Further, Thimphu thromde had not recovered Nu.8,153,520.18 for its revenue losses due to delays in completion of the MLCPs that was worked out by RAA as of 30 June 2019 and thromde is yet to provide the missing documents as highlighted in the observation</p>

## ***Exhibit-E***

<b>Audit Report</b>	: Performance Audit Report on Urban Planning & Development in Thimphu throm (AIN: 16269)				
<b>Date of Issue</b>	: 27 December 2019				
<b>Name of Agency (s)</b>	: Department of Human Settlement, MoWHS and Thimphu Thromde				
<b>No. of Review</b>	: 2 <sup>nd</sup> Review				
<b>Recom. No.</b>	<b>Recomm. in Brief</b>	<b>Status of Last Review</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Status of Review</b>
		implementation of the recommendation.			<p>no.3.2.13, sub observation i &amp; ii of the audit report.</p> <p>Furthermore, thromde has not responded/ justified on the institution of a proper inventory for parking slots and thromde's minimal share from parking fees and other charges.</p> <p>Until such time, the recommendation shall remain status quo.</p> <p>Meanwhile, Thimphu Thromde should provide a timeline for implementation of the recommendation.</p>

\*\*\*\*\*



Reporting on Economy, Efficiency & Effectiveness in the use of Public Resources